

The Academic Journal of St Clements Education Group

# VERITAS

Volume 12 No. 1

March 2021

ISSN 2307-2806

## **Editorial**

### **Letter to the Editor**

**Challenges Between Democratic Good-Governance Practices and Corruption: Where is Sierra Leone?**

**Inequality and Poverty of Syrian Refugees in Turkey**

**The Value of Enterprise Incubator and the Specialized Economic Growth Centers to Cambodia as an Underdeveloped Country**

**Issues in Technical Writing Presentation and Supervision**

**Analysis of African Cultural Values and Their Impact in Nigeria Politics and Government**



### **Creative Destruction**

**The NGO Officers' Perceptions of a Learning Organization and Work Environment Factors Affecting Knowledge Transfer: A Focus on NGOs in Phnom Penh, Cambodia**

**Analytical Study on Factors Affecting Return on Investment to Technical, Vocational Education and Training in Cambodia**

**Important disclaimer**

The publishers, authors and editors are not responsible for the results of any actions on the basis of information in this work, nor for any errors or omissions. The publishers, authors and editors expressly disclaim all and any liability to any person, whether a purchaser of this publication or not, in respect of anything and the consequences of anything, done or omitted to be done by any such person in reliance, in whole or part, on the contents of this publication. The views expressed in this work are not necessarily the official or unanimous view of the office bearers of the St Clements Education Group.

**Copyright**

© St Clements Education Group

All rights are reserved. No part of this publication shall be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means (including but not limited to electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise) without the prior written permission of the copyright holder. Please contact [admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu) if you require permission.

**VERITAS\* is the official Academic Journal of the St Clements Education Group**

**St Clements Institute (Cambodia)** [www.stclements.edu.kh](http://www.stclements.edu.kh)

**SCPU (Switzerland)** [www.scusuisse.ch](http://www.scusuisse.ch)

**St Clements University Higher Education School (Niue)** [www.stclements.edu.nu](http://www.stclements.edu.nu)

**St Clements University (Somalia)** [www.stclements.edu.so](http://www.stclements.edu.so)

**St Clements University (T&C)** [www.stclements.edu](http://www.stclements.edu)

**École Supérieure Universitaire St Clements & Commonwealth (Benin)**

**REGISTERED OFFICE:** 2nd Floor Yellowman & Sons Building,  
Off Old Airport Road, Grand Turk  
TURKS & CAICOS Islands - British West Indies  
Reg. No. E 14905

Web Site: [www.stclements.edu](http://www.stclements.edu)  
Email: [admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu)

**EDITORIAL TEAM:** Editor: Mr Adrian Williams

**CONTRIBUTIONS:** Contributions should be forwarded to Mr Adrian Williams at  
[admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu)

We accept:      Lead Articles  
                     Short Papers  
                     Summaries of Dissertations & Research Reports  
                     Notes  
                     Book Reviews  
                     Letters to the Editor

*Please note the Notes to Contributors* at the back of this edition

**COPYRIGHT:** The contents of this Journal are covered by normal copyright conditions. Portions of the text may be quoted providing that the Journal No., author's name, the title of the article and the page number are given.

**LANGUAGE POLICY:**

*Veritas* is an English Language publication and the Editorial Board aims to ensure that contributors use grammatically correct and idiomatically appropriate English language. However, for many of our contributors English is a second and even third language and from time to time a strict language policy is modified to ensure that good articles are not excluded simply because they do not meet the highest English standards. We also hold it to be important that material be not over edited, providing its message is considered to be clear to the majority of our readers. The general objective that *Veritas* is to create conditions whereby all informed persons are able to contribute to the ongoing debates, regardless of their English language competence and their lack of familiarity with accepted journal protocols.

---

\**Veritas* is Latin for truth, reality.

# VERITAS

THE ACADEMIC JOURNAL OF ST CLEMENTS EDUCATION GROUP – ISSN 2307-2806

Volume 12 No. 1

March 2021



*2021: A year for Optimism*

*Photo by Ian Taylor via Unsplash*

*Source: <https://www.worth.com/reasons-for-optimism-2021/>*

## IN THIS ISSUE

**Editorial** – David Le Cornu

**Letter to the Editor**

**Creative Destruction** – Bruce Duncan

**Challenges Between Democratic Good-Governance Practices and Corruption:  
Where is Sierra Leone?** – Jacomo S. Bangura

**Inequality and Poverty of Syrian Refugees in Turkey** – Kemal Yildirim

**The Value of Enterprise Incubator and the Specialized Economic Growth Centers to Cambodia as  
an Underdeveloped Country** – Chey Tech

**Issues in Technical Writing Presentation and Supervision**  
– Udeh Sabastine Onyemaechi & Udeh Nkemdilim Virginia

**Analysis of African Cultural Values and Their Impact in Nigeria Politics and Government**  
– Frederick Ozor

**The NGO Officers' Perceptions of a Learning Organization and Work Environment Factors  
Affecting Knowledge Transfer: A Focus on NGOs in Phnom Penh, Cambodia** – Kep Bunly

**Analytical Study on Factors Affecting Return on Investment to Technical, Vocational Education  
and Training in Cambodia** – Sok Chanrithy

# EDITORIAL:

## WHY ‘VERITAS’ IS NOT A PEER REVIEW JOURNAL

**Dr David Le Cornu\***

*President - St Clements Education Group  
(DBA, DIPFM, MBA, FAICD)*

‘Veritas’ was established to publish St Clements senior students and faculty members research articles. A small editorial committee checks articles to see if they fulfill ‘Veritas’ requirements but they are not peer reviewed pre-publication. Readers of ‘Veritas’ are all invited to submit articles on any subject area or write a letter to the editor for publication on the chosen topic. The problem with peer reviews is the article needs to confer with the peer reviewer’s opinion at the time on the subject matter. Peer reviews act as a filter to radical ideas on a topic area.

‘Veritas’ believes new ideas should be encouraged. It welcomes conflicting articles widening the debate on ideas – not stifling discussions on issues. The editorial committee will reject articles which are designed to insult a view rather than present an alternative view and if the quality of the writing is unacceptable.

Some articles are summaries of Doctorate dissertations not written in English (Arabic, Turkish or Putonghua). Some tolerance is given to the quality of translation for such articles. Thus ‘Veritas’ is deliberately not a peer review publication.

---

## BEST ARTICLE FOR THE JOHN POTTER LITERACY AWARD 2020

A number of well written articles have been nominated for the 2020 John Potter Literacy Award. The best of the articles have now been chosen.

The **winner** of the 2020 John Potter Literacy Award is the article **“Founders Death and Survival of Family Business: A Curious Phenomenon in Corporate Governance”** by Dr Udeh Sabastine Onyemaechi.

The **runner-up** article was selected as **“Challenges for the Future of Distance Education at Universidade Púnguè, Mozambique”** by Dr Godwen Veremu.

A **highly commended mention** goes to the articles: **“Changing Path-Dependencies through Mutual Learning”** by Professor Dr Bruce Duncan and **“Federalism is a Fundamental Principle for Sustainable Development”** by Dr Landson Thindwa.

Other articles **nominated** for the John Potter Literacy Award included the following: **“Justification and Appreciation of Non-Formal and Informal Learning in Higher Learning Institutions: Reflections and an Interpretative Clarity”** by Sir, Dr Christopher Oyat and **“The Great Apostasy - Part Two: The Deification of Nimrod and the Woman”** by Dr John Potter.

Certificates for these well deserved recipients of the John Potter Literacy Award for 2020 will be sent out in the next few weeks.

Congratulations to all of the nominated authors.

‘Veritas’ is looking for people to nominate articles for the award. Please contact the editor if you would be willing to participate in this role at [admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu).

If you wish to read any of these articles please email Dr David Le Cornu and copies can be sent to you electronically. Alternatively, ‘Veritas’ publications are available on our website and can be accessed via our e-library at [www.stclements.edu/library.html](http://www.stclements.edu/library.html).



**\*Dr David Le Cornu**  
*President - St Clements Education Group*  
He can be reached at [admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu)

## LETTER TO THE EDITOR

---

*Dear Editor,*

*I read Professor Bruce Duncan's article "Wake Up and Smell the Coffee: A Solution to Violence-Framed Socio-Political Issues" from 'Veritas' Volume 11, No. 2 November 2020. He discussed traditional ancient slavery which was not specifically racist and he asks where/why racism came in. I suggest that in the USA where descendants of slaves still seem to be damaged by the slave experience, which was over 165 years ago, it was the fact it was largely a democratic society, particularly in 1800s social terms, that created extreme racism related to slaves. In traditional societies (Greece, Roman, Arab) slaves were just people at the bottom of the social scale, there were levels of people and slaves were 'bottom' level but they were still human beings. In democratic America with a belief in the Justice of Man (and to a lesser degree women) how can you possibly justify slaves own another human being. The solution was to de-humanize them, exaggerate all difference between them and the non-slave community and rate them as beast of burden to fellow humans.*

*Ernest David*

---

---

***The editors at 'Veritas' also welcome and encourage any responses to the articles in this publication by way of the LETTERS TO THE EDITOR forum.***



# CREATIVE DESTRUCTION

Professor Dr Bruce R. Duncan\*

## Introduction

Our literary journey will introduce Professor Joseph Schumpeter, who coined the phrase, “Creative Destruction”, flag up its background, and consult selected vocabulary from economics and entrepreneurialism. After that, we will focus on a paraphrase of Schumpeter’s concept vis-à-vis entrepreneurs, before ending with selected examples of “Creative Destruction” ... we will connect dots of history that predate Schumpeter’s 1942 idea.

## Joseph Alois Schumpeter (1883 – 1950)

Schumpeter was born in Moravia (now Třešť, Czech Republic), and rose to prominence in Austria during his adult life. Schumpeter became a political economist, a sociologist, prolific writer<sup>1</sup> and Marxist who contributed to academic and political arenas. The Moravian academic had served briefly as an Austrian government Minister and worked in Austria’s banking spheres. Schumpeter had also lectured at the universities of Czernowitz, Graz, and Bonn before his 18 years professorship at Harvard University from 1932 – 1950 (Cunningham, n.d.). He had emigrated to the United States in 1939 and obtained citizenship during the destructive rumblings of Nazi dominance. It was at America’s Ivy League Harvard University where he earned fame.

Schumpeter argued that Capitalism would eventually perish of its own success, giving way to some form of public control or Socialism (Schumpeter, 1942, Chapter 12). Arguably, the overall global trend suggests that Schumpeter might have also been a political prophet!

## Creative Destruction (Schumpeter’s Gale)

Of interest are the influences that probably helped shape Schumpeter’s thinking at that time. Countries were licking their economic, social and psychological wounds inflicted by the financial crash of the Great Depression of the 1930s. The changing face of politics had caused the United States to enter WWII on the side of the Allies in the wake of the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbour (7 December 1941). Life was changing and, included in the political, economic, social, psychological and cultural changes, the writings of Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels condemned the bourgeoisie (the supporters of Capitalism) for the “constant revolutionising of production [and]

uninterrupted disturbance of all social conditions” (Kopp, n.d.).

Notwithstanding the hype surrounding communism, the forces creating the national and international uncertainties probably impacted Schumpeter and, in 1942, he coined the term “Creative Destruction” to explain the economic outcomes emerging in the wake of political chaos. Arguably, his Marxist leanings, also influenced by the “The Communist Manifesto”, contributed to his theory.

## “Creative Destruction” – definitions

Creative destruction can be described as the dismantling of long-standing practices in order to make way for innovation.

Schumpeter describes creative destruction as innovations in the manufacturing process that increase productivity, but the term has been adopted for use in many other contexts.

Kopp, 2019



“The act of a newly created thing destroying its predecessors. This is a common occurrence in industries that thrive on innovation to keep their businesses successful.”

“For example, the music industry has watched sales of CDs drop to record lows as a result of more consumers downloading music for free or through services such as iTunes.”

Source: MBN 2020

<sup>1</sup> Books by Joseph Schumpeter (Author of Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy) (goodreads.com).

## “Creative Destruction” a paraphrased interpretation

Creative destruction described the **deliberate** dismantling of established processes. However, Schumpeter’s genius has evolved into describing the actions of those who drive commercial and industrial engines worldwide – the entrepreneurs. We can better understand the two sides of change as the “away with the horse and cart – never mind those who will lose their livelihood”, and enter the “new” form of transport that ran on petrol – the Benz and the Model T Ford. Voila!

So it is that the 21<sup>st</sup>-Century entrepreneur brings change. Schumpeter’s paraphrased definition now applies to the visionary entrepreneur who takes the risk to create “another way forward”. Their many characteristics include the flair for innovation, arrogance, determination/stubbornness and the need to be an individual.

So, the relevance of Schumpeter’s economic focus and the impact of change on society now remains a core part of entrepreneurialism. Entrepreneurs are agents of change – their creative initiatives move some individuals, organisations, cultures, and countries forwards. Yes, Luddites, the acolytes of the Flat Earth movement and conspiracy theorists will irritate and, with Trumpian-like tantrums, throw their toys out of the cot. Still, progress will continue – change is an endemic part of life. However, we must not forget that humankind and animals are conditioned to defend their territory (Ardrey, 1966). So, to allow change is to invite destruction of the status quo. This event means loss, and natural conditioning will protect what is up for grabs but still in the hands of the head of the “kingdom”. Thus, most successful entrepreneurs or intrapreneurs<sup>2</sup> need Solomon’s wisdom. They must also have the lion’s strength, Job’s patience, and the cunning of the fox – and a thick skin!

Creativity is unsettling because innovation will also disrupt traditional, political, economic, educational, social, religious, lifestyles and the established power base. In contrast, the change-resistant path-dependencies that structure the “as it was, in the beginning, is now, and ever shall be ...” way of doing things will sadly obstruct and bedevil progress. Thankfully, entrepreneurs will ignore the fossilising dinosaurs who stand in the path of progress. Creative and innovative concepts are the spears of “Creative Destruction” that will change the status quo.

However, will the impact of COVID-19 cause the boffins to wake-up and start expanding the formal

---

<sup>2</sup> An employee within a large company who takes direct responsibility for turning an idea into a profitable new product, service, business ... often instead of leaving to start their own company (Cambridge English Dictionary online).

education industry to online learning? This move will cause a massive upheaval that will definitely disturb “fragile egos” as well as challenge the need for fee-devouring buildings. The process could invite innovative links to artificial intelligence (AI), retraining lecturers and accepting the need to CHANGE!

## “Creative Destruction” – history in the making

The writing of Karl Marx identified colonialism as “Creative Destruction”. In his book, “On Colonialism and Modernization”<sup>3</sup>, he described the centuries-old historical flow of colonial exploitation and social changes of the stronger over the weaker. Factually, colonisation has not only been the exploitative tool of western and eastern cultures, but the process whereby the colonised had to turn towards the culture of the colonizers to find success – change! Thus, it was that the process of creative destruction did away with national conventions and moved a country forward with new but enforced innovations. The changes did not dovetail into the innate path-dependencies of the colonised and emerged in the rise of nationalism, independence and self-determination – more change!

The thought-provoking book by Young (2016) traces the evolving impact and outcomes of colonialism that morphed into imperialism, to neo-colonialism and post-colonialism – more changes. The often insidious manipulation of colonising strategy had turned civilisations away from their cultural heritage to don the dominant culture’s art, music, education, norms, mores, path dependencies – and clothing!

Arguably, the low-key new-colonialism is evident in China’s subtle moves into Africa using the sweetener of Foreign Direct Investment (FDI). Specifically, in South Africa, the strategy of the Peoples Republic of China (Boje, 2020) became globally evident when, in November 2020, the Chinese Ambassador gave an English copy of President X’s latest book as “golden keys” to better understand and interpret China’s development story in the new era<sup>4</sup>.

President Xi advocating high levels of discipline, co-ordination, and clean governance to safeguard the authority and leadership of the CPC Central Committee in advancing “socialist democracy with Chinese characteristics” and improving scientific and democratic decision-making.<sup>7</sup>

Source: Boje 2020

Yes, Schumpeter’s theory is a proven hypothesis. His concept deserves respect that is underlined by the cyclical changing strategy of nations, organisations and

---

<sup>3</sup> On Colonialism and Modernization. Karl Marx (Edited by Shlomo Avineri). Amazon. Doubleday. ASIN: B000Z461CW.

<sup>4</sup> This is Volume III of the writings of Chinese President Xi Jinping. Mao Tse Tung’s *Little Red Book* is archived material.



individuals to build bigger and more powerful kingdoms – regardless of the destruction following in its wake. Progress is an unstoppable and irreversible evolutionary reality. Humankind will never be content to live under any lockdown and will continue evolving while flexing its muscles to ensure the survival of the fittest!

## Sources

Ardrey, R (1966). *The Territorial Imperative*. Amazon. ISBN. 978-0-9886043-1-5.

Boje, V (2020). *President Xi Jinping's book is 'golden key' to understanding China's success*. Available at [President Xi Jinping's book is 'golden key' to understanding China's success \(iol.co.za\)](#). [Accessed 2 February 2021].

Caballero, R (2020). *Creative Destruction*. Available at [What is creative destruction? Definition and examples - Market Business News](#) [Accessed 2 February 2021].

Cunningham J. M. (Editor) (n.d.). *Joseph Schumpeter: American Economist*. Available at [Joseph Schumpeter | American economist | Britannica](#) [Accessed 25 January 2021].

Kopp, C. M. (n.d. citing Marx and Engels). *Creative Destruction*. Available at [Creative Destruction Definition \(investopedia.com\)](#) [Accessed 23 January 2021].

Kopp, C. M. *Creative Destruction*. Available at [Creative Destruction Definition \(investopedia.com\)](#). [Accessed 1 February 2021].

Marx, K., and Engels, F. (1848). *Manifesto of the Communist Party*. Available at [Manifesto of the Communist Party \(marxists.org\)](#) [accessed 24 January 2021].

Reinart, H., and Reinart, E.S. *Creative Destruction in Economics: Nietzsche, Sombart, Schumpeter. Friedrich Nietzsche (1844–1900), 2006, Volume 3*. ISBN: 978-0-387-32979-6. [Accessed 23 January 2021].

Schumpeter, J. A. (1943). *Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy*. Amazon (UK). ISBN: 0415107628.

Swedberg, R (1991). *Joseph A Schumpeter: His Life and Work*. ISBN: 978-0-7456-1174—7.

Young, R. J. C. (2016). *Postcolonialism : an historical introduction*. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. ISBN 9781405120944.

## About the Author



**\*Professor Dr Bruce R. Duncan holds:** a Certificate in Life Coaching – Newcastle College; a Diploma in Counselling – CSCT, a Diploma (TESOL) Distinction, a Diploma in Teaching Business English (Distinction) – LTTC, a Cambridge CELTA, an MA (TESOL) – St Clements University, a D.Litt – St Clements University, an Honorary D.Ed – Commonwealth University. He is the founder and Chief Executive of Sanctuary Services, a Fellow of the Royal Society for the Encouragement of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce (RSA) and President of the Institute of Management Specialists – Comp.I.M.S. (Dip.IMS). Email address [110940@msn.com](mailto:110940@msn.com)

# CHALLENGES BETWEEN DEMOCRATIC GOOD-GOVERNANCE PRACTICES AND CORRUPTION: WHERE IS SIERRA LEONE?

Dr Jacomo S. Bangura\*

*D.Litt - St Clements University*

The complete version of this summarised article is available at:  
<http://www.stclements.edu/articles/DemocraticGood-Governance.pdf>

Globally, the concept of '*Democracy and Good-Governance Practice*', cannot be easily addressed without focusing on a possible challenge - '*Corruption*'; especially in a country like Sierra Leone. The focus here is mainly on the issues of '*Democratic Good-Governance Practice, and Corruption*', as foods for thought.

*Democratic Good-Governance Practice*, could be interpreted according to the political practices in specific countries. This is like comparing the types of democracies practices by the then Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR), and China, as compared to those practiced by the Western Democracies: United States of America (USA), and the United Kingdom (UK).

*Good-Governance concept* is derived from addressing the precepts of '*Participatory-Democracy*' as it relates to people being involved in choosing their leaderships: provide equal opportunities; freedom of speech; equitable justice system; and respect for human rights.

Somebody who can be described as the father of democracy, the *First President of the United States of America, Abraham Lincoln*, conceptualized a democratic-government to be "*a government of the people, for the people, and by the people*"; making it more pragmatic when those empowered by the people to rule them, do so in the interest of those who elect them.

'*Good-Governance*' can be interpreted as:

***“Rule of Law; Human Rights; and Peace; resulting to: Ensuring peace-building; Improving national security; Reforming public sector; Enforcing National Anti-Corruption; Improving access to justice and human right; and Promoting positive attitudinal change”.***<sup>1</sup>

(*SL-PRSP 2-AGENDA FOR CHANGE Strategy*)

From *Chucks Oluigbo (Something to Think About – THE FUTURE OF DEMOCRACY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE IN AFRICA: STANDARD TIMES DAILY NEWSPAPER; Monday, December 13 2010; 10)*, “The dual concepts of democracy and good-

governance have long eluded the African continent; because more than four decades after the attainment of independence, many an African nation still grapple with establishing an enduring democracy. Although that good-governance seems to have taken roots...”.

“One of the greatest problems militating against the realization of this dream of a democratic Africa has been the tendency among leaders of African nations to pay lip-service to the ideals of participatory-democracy, while at the same time formulating policies and perpetrating actions that are antithetical to democracy, thereby bringing about the negation of democracy”.

We have been experiencing “... pseudo-democracies, where democracy has come to mean *a government of a select few, for the select few, and by a select few*”; hence wars, civil strife, high poverty level, diseases prevalence, '*corruption*', and prostrate economies. These are all indicators of long years of misrule, and political monopoly.

For Chucks, “The journey though is far from begun; there appears a glimmer of hope at the end of the tunnel”, and that... “All hope is not lost”. But the task ahead is '*herculean*'; (since) “*where there is a will, there will certainly be a way*”. This is because: “*A journey of a thousand miles begins with a step*”.

Bedornatu Kamara (2010) says: “Citizen- Participation builds a better democracy. Citizens get to choose their leaders in all elections. They can also express their opinions through the media and peaceful protest”. That: “*Human rights* are those values that reflect respect for human life and dignity; freedom of expression; right to equality; right to basic education; and health care”; and that “...Intimidation, corruption and threats to citizens during or before an election, are against the principles of democracy”.

From the Sierra Leone (Written) Constitution, “...this supreme law serves to guide legislations and laws they make; hence the reason for any democracy to serve under a well-defined and well-structured Constitution to protect every citizen, irrespective of any party affiliations”.

(Culled from the Standard Times: Bedornatu Kamara; Tuesday, December 14 2010 – **SOCIETY: CITIZEN PARTICIPATION AND PRINCIPLES OF DEMOCRACY**; 7).

From views of the United Nations Secretary-General, **Kofi A. Annan (1998)**: “*Good Governance means the creation of serious and well-functioning legal and political institutions which citizens consider as legitimate, which gives them power, and in which they participate in making decisions that affect their lives. ...it is perhaps the single most important factor in eradicating poverty and promoting development*”. A statement from the ‘*World Public Servant*’ should be a pointer for the way forward for developing economies.

Some of the qualities of participatory-democracy and Good-Governance should include: **Justice; Transparency; Acceptability; Fairness; Egalitarianism; Tolerance; Sustainable Development; Democratic good-governance; State Security through the Military, Police and Prison; etc.** But Sierra Leone’s ‘*military*’ have abrogated those enshrined tenets: ... “*to defend its territorial integrity and to provide the necessary security structures for the protection of the people and property*”. They have relegated its citizenry to *Coups and Counter-Coups*, between 1967 and 1997.

‘*Civil Society Organizations*’ also need recognition, because it is believed that - “The key requirement for a post-conflict society is a functioning Civil Administration: well-trained Civilian Police Force; Independent Judiciary; and Humane Prison and Detention Facilities”.

(Culled from “*Transitional Appeal for Relief & Recovery in Sierra Leone - Strengthening of Civil Society: 58*”).

Sierra Leoneans are living in abject poverty and squalid conditions; malnutrition and starvation for the majority of the populace, who live on **0-1-0** meal per day; living below **US\$1** per day; and lacking access to basic means of quality life and dignity; while some members of the society live in opulence and unbridled power.

It could be seen that in the proper practice of democracy and good-governance, every other function that affects the state, could be better made operational when proper organization and management functions are put in place for all stakeholders to complement each other in a participative manner.

The genesis of the concept of ‘*Corruption*’ could be traced from the Latin word - ‘*Corruptus (to destroy)*’. It is a basis for its discussion within any country’s situation.

Historically, corruption is nothing new, starting from the homes, religions, NGOs, countries, etc.; but the commonest form of corruption globally, has a

‘*Political Characterization*’. From David Tam-Baryoh’s Book, ‘*Sierra Leone: The Impeding Effects of CORRUPTION on National Development*’, the practice means: “*bribery*”, “*perversion or misuse of public office or position*”, “*nepotism*”, “*patronage*”, “*sale of public office*”, and “*privatization of the state*”.

The other manifestations of corrupt behavior should also incorporate in the following: *embezzlement, use of one’s position for self-enrichment; bestowing favours on relatives and friends; partiality; abuse of public property; leaking and or abuse of government information*, etc. (Preface of Alam’s views: 1989: 442).

From (SPECIAL COMMENTARY - THE SATTELLITE, VOL. 36 NO. 44 DAILY NEWSPAPER - 7th DECEMBER, 2020), “... since the 1970s, Corruption remains the most daunting challenge to good-governance, sustainable economic growth, peace, poverty, stability, inequality, and development in our country; making us concomitantly underdeveloped. It discourages foreign investments, distortion in resource allocation and competitive markets, increases the cost of doing business, and reduces the net-value of public spending, quality of services, public infrastructure, and volume of tax revenues.”

In Sierra Leone, corruption has been defined as ‘... *the abuse of entrusted power for personal gain or for the benefit of a group to which one owes allegiance. In local parlance referred to as ‘yuki-yuki’ (shady deeds)*’.

Also, Transparency International, (2007: xxi) in its *Global Corruption Report 2007*, states: “*Corruption in Judicial System*” means “*both financial or material gain and non-material gain, such as the furtherance of political or professional ambitions*”. The United Nations Development Programme Anti-Corruption Practice Note, says: Corruption is “... *the misuse of public power, office or authority for private benefit - through bribery, extortion, influence peddling, nepotism, fraud, speed money or embezzlement*”.

**Kofi A. Annan**, UN Secretary General speaking at the UN Convention on Corruption (New York 2004), stated that:

“*Corruption is an insidious plague that has a wide range of corrosive effects on society. It undermines democracy and the rule of law, leads to violations of human rights, distorts markets, erodes the quality of life and allows organized crime, terrorism and other threats to human security to flourish*”.

From the ‘*STANDARD TIMES*’ Daily Newspaper: *Thursday March 31, 2011 – ‘FEATURE*’, featuring **FADDA BAKISH (The Paradox of Corruption and Growth: 9)**, For Social Scientists, Corruption is:

“...behavior which deviates from the normal duties of a public role because of private – family and clique; pecuniary or status gains.....This includes bribery and misappropriation of public resources for private uses.” She emphasized “.... the absence of clear cut separation of powers between the judiciary and executive arms often results in the latter exercising unique influence over the poor”;<sup>2</sup>

The ‘Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC)’ of Sierra Leone was established in March, 2000, and began operations in August 2000. “*It is a body established by an Act of Parliament to lead the fight against corruption in Sierra Leone. It was set up.... as the government’s response to dealing with corruption .... an autonomous body with powers to prevent and investigate reports of corruption by public officials*”.

Mission of the Commission: “*Leading the fight against corruption through public education, prevention, enforcement and compliance for the benefit of all citizens*”.

Its main objectives include:

- a) “*to take all steps as may be necessary for the prevention, eradication or suppression of corruption and corrupt practices;*
- b) *to investigate instances of alleged or suspected corruption referred to it by any person or authority or which has come to its attention, ...;et.*
- c) *to prosecute all offences committed under this Act*”.<sup>3</sup>

Its mandates are:

“*By taking necessary measures for the prevention of corruption in government ministries, departments and other public bodies from whom corrupt practices can be reduced;*

*By educating the public about the ills of corruption, and soliciting public support in its fight;*

*By investigating instances of alleged or suspected corrupt practices referred to it by way of complaint or otherwise*”.<sup>4</sup>

Some of the following are among a number of practices which the ‘Anti-Corruption Act’ refers to as corrupt:

“*Corrupt Acquisition of Wealth; Bribery of Public Officer to Influence Decision of Public Body; Soliciting, Accepting or Obtaining Advantage for Public Officer; Misappropriation of Public Property; Corrupt Transactions with Agents; et.*”<sup>5</sup>

Legally, the Commission is expected to be an independent entity. “*Part II Sub-Section 9 of the AC*

*Act 2008 provides that the Commission shall not, in the performance of its functions, be subject to the direction or control of any person/authority*”.

As a backup, the ACC is supported by the creation of the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NACS) “...as Sierra Leone’s commitment to the fight against corruption.... a pillar that aims to make the integrity very strong in Sierra Leone”.

(Culled from ‘**ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSION – SIERRA LEONE**’: Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs) – A Source Book).

From the *News Time Africa (2010)*: “*The Media and the Fight against Corruption: The Sierra Leone Experience*”, there are pointers at specific issues relating to the ‘*Anti-Corruption Act*’...

“Greed and avarice, seem to take the better side of people who have been entrusted with public funds. People appointed in some positions begin to produce evidences of pilfering with public resources, since unfortunately, the governed and the governor all hail from poverty-stricken backgrounds.”

“Sierra Leone relies on external aid to fund 65% of its national yearly development budget, mainly from the World Bank and the British government. But the Commission has had little powers to minimize corruption in the country; because it “...did not have the mandate to investigate for action court without the advices of the Attorney-General’s Office. Therefore, the promise to fight corruption could not win a good position on the UK government’s stated conditionality of transparency; hence (June 2006) the British government withheld aid worth 40 million pounds sterling”.

A common language used in most cases is, ‘*brown envelops*’, with monies or cheques to represent pre-determined understanding, among the prescribed stakeholders.

Despite the poor results since the establishment of the Commission, President, Dr. Ernest Bai Koroma presented a policy statement in his inaugural address to the Sierra Leone Parliament (October 5, 2007); a promise for someone who is ascending political power for the first time:

“.... *during my campaign for President, I emphasized zero tolerance for fighting corruption. I intend to implement that strategy by strengthening the powers of the Anti-Corruption Commission, and ensuring its independence in investigations and prosecution*”.<sup>6</sup>

But the roles of the Justice Ministry accentuated some differences between the official role of the ACC, and its being muzzled by the Minister, acting on behalf of the President. Thus any state which promises to be practicing Western Democratic-Precepts is doomed,

when it takes '*Party Issues*' above judicial control. It should read: '*The Country's Interest above Party Interest.*'

The '*Media (Fourth Estate)*' should be seen in corruption issues, since the successes recorded by the ACC needing public views, without censure by government. This is because problems can be visible in a country where corrupt government officials have the resources to co-opt the services of even the *Journalists*.

President Alhaji Dr. Ahmad Tejan Kabbah established the Commission, and illustrated in his testimony to the 'Truth and Reconciliation Commission' (TRC), that:

*"I have often described myself as the Chief Servant of the people and require all other public officers to regard themselves as servants of the people. .... This of course will require an adjustment of the constitution position."*<sup>7</sup>

Any '*Policy Statement*' from the '*Chief of State and Fountain of Honour*', should be regarded as reality; but it is politically motivated to entice Aid Donors to come to rescue Sierra Leone, because such rhetoric is followed by disassociation from implementation; presenting the government's negative anti-corruption campaign. There is unwillingness to prioritize the good of the country ahead of the ruling party. This puts - '*party politics ahead of national development considerations*'. Also, the **President** controls the **Judiciary** and retains the power to appoint and dismiss Judiciary Officers.

Bakish concludes, in line with Lord Acton's observations, (Friedrich 1990: 16), that: "...*all power tends to corrupt and absolute power corrupts absolutely*". In Sierra Leone, the '*over-twenty years of one-party rule*', saw political intolerance, intimidation, and executions of opponents of the ruling party.

With several resolutions between 2000 and 2002 on corruption, the United Nations Secretariat Journey ended when ".....it was resolved that in accordance with resolution 57/169, member states (Dec. 9-11, 2003), agreed that the UN Convention against Corruption be annexed to previous accepted resolutions and be open to signature at the High-level political signing conference in Merida, Mexico. Since then, **9<sup>th</sup> December** has been designated '*International Anti-Corruption Day*'".

The Southern African Development Community Protocol Against Corruption, posited:

*"any act referred to in Article 3 and includes bribery or any other behaviour in relation to persons entrusted with responsibilities in the public and private sectors which violates their duties as public officials, private employees, independent agents or other relationships of that kind and aimed*

*at obtaining undue advantage of any kind for themselves or others"*.

International Law states that... "*Corruption is usually regarded as the abuse of public authority for personal benefits*". From this, the intent (*mens rea or guilty mind*) and the action (*actus reus or acquiescence or the guilty or criminal act*), must be established beyond all reasonable doubts by law after proper investigation. These should be day-to-day occurrences, as presented by a *Journalist*, David Tam-Baryoh: (*Ibid*).<sup>8</sup>

A collaborative report (May 2006) by the Civil Society Alternative Process of Sierra Leone (CSAP-SL), and the Network Movement for Justice and Development (NMJD), on: '*The Stolen Happiness*', negates: "...though debt-relief may increase economic growth, stimulate private investments and increase positive international credit ratings, proceeds from the debt-relief have no positive economic effects on the poor". Further, ".....the institutional structures designed for delivering social services...are replete with corruption, thus impeding national development".

The argument put forward is that salaries for workers; so it becomes very tempting for workers to be delegated with enormous responsibilities of supervising development programmes, which go to billions of Leones. It is not surprising to see a worker who may not even earn Le500,000/00 (Five Hundred Thousand Leones) monthly net salary, building houses and owning expensive vehicles.

*Peter Eigen*, Chairman of Transparency International, presented at the African Union (AU) Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption, by African Heads of State in Maputo (Mozambique) (July, 2003), positive intentions, to: "...provide an ideal platform for regional cooperation among African States in the fight against corruption. It has the means of assisting governments in implementing practices that will promote accountability and transparency".

Some different hot-spots of corruption in Sierra Leone included - David Tam- Baryoh (2008):

- **Health; Education; Public Servicer; Financial; Judicial; Political; Security and Safety; Police; Prison: NGO Accountability:**<sup>9</sup>

But a National Anti-Corruption Strategy Paper (2005), added potential areas: **Energy and Power; Defence; Transport and Communication.**

The country's over seven million inhabitants, do not deserve the kind of poverty they face, considering the abundant natural resources: Diamonds, Gold, Chromite, Rutile, Bauxite, etc.; and agricultural resources: Piassava, Coffee, Cocoa (Cacao), Rice (staple food), Cattle, and Fishery products.

The functional activities of the international community (EU, DFID, IMF, World Bank, and

INGOs), deserve special commendation as Sierra Leone joins the international forum for a country which is preparing for change through good democratic-governance practices. The British Government's concern, contributed to the restructuring of the key security sectors - Sierra Leone Police (SLP), Fire Force, Military.

Generally, in any country where the concept of '*Democratic Good-Governance*', through a well-structured governance is in practice, it is very important to see if '*Corruption is not Peeping*'; this is if the thought of not running a '*state-within-a-state*', by fusing '*Democratic Good-Governance and Corruption*', as partners in crime – A food for thought for Sierra Leone, and other countries.

## FOOTNOTES

- <sup>1</sup> Issues which border around semblances of '**Good Governance**' through participatory democratic practices within the Sierra Leone context, as per the Sierra Leone Government's '**AGENDA FOR CHANGE –PRSP 2**' strategy.
- <sup>2</sup> Culled from **STANDARD TIMES** Daily Newspaper: **Fadda Bakish**; Thursday, February 3, 2011 – **FEATURE: Controlling Corruption in Sierra Leone: 13**.
- <sup>3</sup> Objectives of the Anti-Corruption Commission of Sierra Leone.
- <sup>4</sup> Mandate of the Anti-Corruption Commission of Sierra Leone.
- <sup>5</sup> Some practices referred to by the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) of Sierra Leone as '**Corruption**' or '**Corruption Practices**'.
- <sup>6</sup> One of the many challenges by Dr. Ernest Bai Koroma during his campaign trail as '**Opposition Leader**' (2007 Election).
- <sup>7</sup> A testimony to the '**Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC)**' of Sierra Leone by the erstwhile President of Sierra Leone, Alhaji Dr. Ahmad Tejan Kabbah.
- <sup>8</sup> David Tam Baryoh's contributions as recommendations/guidelines on strategies to address '**Corruption Practices**' in the Sierra Leone context.
- <sup>9</sup> A broad spectrum of possible areas of '**Corruption**' and or '**Corruption Practices**' in Sierra Leone.

## REFERENCES

Anti-Corruption Commission (SL): Frequently Asked Questions.

Baryoh, David T.; Sierra Leone: The Impeding Effects of CORRUPTION on National Development: Freetown, Sierra Leone; (2008).

Catholic Relief Services (CRS) Activities' Reports in Sierra Leone: 2002-2009.

Daily News Bulletins in Sierra Leone.

Kamara, Abu Bakarr; B. Sc. (Development and Economics) Dissertation; Institute of Advanced Management and Technology (IAMTECH) - 2010.

Mbaku, John Mukum; CORRUPTION IN AFRICA - Causes, Consequences, and Cleanups: LEXINGTO BOOKS; A division of Roman & Little Publishers, Inc.; First Paper Edition 2010.

New African Magazine (AN IC PUBLICATION): 44<sup>th</sup> Year November 2010; No. 500 (Celebration Issue - Collector's Edition).

Newday International Magazine: Vol.06 No. 02; Oct/Nov 2010.

SIERRA LEONE ENCYCLOPEDIA 2006; A comprehensive representation on the general development of the country, before, during, and after the Civil Strife: DVD/PDF.

Sierra Leone Government: "Sierra Leone Vision '**SWEET SALONE**' – United People Progressive Nation Attractive Country (A Bright Future): Strategies for National Development: Aug. 2003.

The Academic Journal of St Clements University: VERITAS; Volume 1 No. 2 February 2010.

## ABOUT THE AUTHOR



*\*Dr Jacomo S. Bangura is a Sierra Leonean, 'Professional Academic Social-Scientist', with passion for 'Rural Poverty Reduction'. **Currently:** Lecturer – University of Management and Technology (UNIMTECH); **Certificates:** Doctor of Letters – Sociology: St Clements University; Certificate: Personnel and Industrial Relations – IPAM (USL); M.A. (RSD), Reading University, (UK); B.A., Dip. Ed – Fourah Bay College (USL); Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society (FRGS). **Member:** Health-Related Programmes in Sierra Leone, and Africa (South of the Sahara); and also 'Gender-Sensitive'. He may be reached at [jacsohbee@yahoo.co.uk](mailto:jacsohbee@yahoo.co.uk)*



# INEQUALITY AND POVERTY OF SYRIAN REFUGEES IN TURKEY

Professor Dr Kemal Yildirim\*

## Abstract

This paper discovers detail of the most important factors on the issues concerning flow of refugees to Turkey such as status of the refugees in poverty and inequality. What are the basic factors that influence status of Syrian refugees in the country and how inequality causes poverty?

Refugee's reasons such as (1) armed conflict, (2) ethnic intolerance, (3) religious fundamentalism and (4) political tensions, will be briefly investigated as to why there is an influx of refugees and how irregular and transit migrations came to Turkey, particularly from the Middle East (Syria, Iran-Iraq) starting from 1980s.

## Turkey's Migrant Crisis

Turkey's migrant crisis or in a way we can define from now on as [Turkey's refugee crisis](#) was a period during 2010s characterized by high numbers of Non-immigrants as refugees arriving in Turkey. Turkey thus became the top refugee receiving country in 2014 (1,587,374) Turkey's refugees, Syrians and refugees from Turkey. *Source: a country of insecurity - Ibrahim Sirkeci, mid-2015 (1,838,848), and mid-2016 (2,869,421) (Source: TURKEY FACT SHEET July 2019) reported on UNHCR registered refugees by country/territory of asylum [sort each year on descending].* Turkey's refugee breakdown in 2019 was "neighbor countries": Syrians 3.6 M, Iraqis 142,000, Iranians 39,000, "Asia": Afghans 172,000, "Africa": 11,700. Reported by UNHCR in 2018, Turkey hosted 63.4% of all the "registered Syrian refugees." [8] On 27 Feb. 2020 [refugees of the Syrian Civil War in Turkey](#) was 3,587,266.

Turkey is known as a transit country for the refugees to flee. Thus part of a pattern established during the [European migrant crisis](#) in which large groups of immigrants (displaced people, refugees or asylum seekers) from other continents used Turkey as a "transit country" (gateway to Europe) during "[major refugee flows](#)" which began in the mid-20th century. Part of the [migrant crisis](#) of the 21st century Turkey received refugees especially from the Middle East countries and such refugees fled from the Iran-Iraq War and Iranian Revolution, Gulf War, War in Afghanistan and Syrian Civil War. In managing this crisis Turkey passed the [Law on Foreigners and International Protection and the Temporary Protection](#), established [Syria-Turkey barrier](#) and [Iran-Turkey barrier](#) to stop smuggling and security and was

involved in [ceasefires in Syria](#) which established [Safe Zones](#) in order to halt the fighting.

Most of the refugees are people of the Syrian Civil War in Turkey and can be classified as protected [Syrian refugees](#) originating from the [Syrian Civil War](#). Turkey hosted over 3.6 million (2019 number) "registered" refugees and delivered aid reaching \$24 billion (total between 2011-2018) on refugee assistance. The large scale return to Syria uncertain (unending conflict) Turkey has focused on how to manage their presence, more registered refugees than any other country, in Turkish society by addressing their legal status, basic needs, employment, education, and impact on local communities. (*Source: Jim Zanotti, Turkey: Background and U.S. Relations In Brief, February 8, 2019, page 13, Congressional Research Service.*) As part of [Turkey's migrant crisis](#), according to UNHCR, in 2018 Turkey was hosting 63.4% of all the refugees in the world; that is 3,564,919 "registered" refugees from the Middle East, Africa and Afghanistan in total.

## A - Inequality Issues

Literature on poverty offers many definitions, each highlighting the standpoint of its user.<sup>1</sup> Inequality itself is a broad term, for many intellectuals inequality is when people are not treated as equals, with the same privileges, status and rights due to their common humanity.

To address inequality it is important that the disadvantaged are supported with appropriate resources to level the playing field alongside provision of equal opportunities.<sup>2</sup>

We are certainly aware that while a number of people are fully incorporated into the advanced industrial economy of the emerging global system, others are marginalized.

Poverty is regional in some parts of the world. What we notice is that highly developed nations may accept immigrants who bring human capital and their investment while most others are excluded even when there are political as well as economic reasons for their migration and humanitarian reasons for their admission.

<sup>1</sup> International Poverty Centre, UNDP, 2006, What is Poverty? Concepts and Measures, Poverty in Focus.

<sup>2</sup> Oxfam, 2012, No Accident: Resilience and Inequality of Risk

However it is clear that humanitarian concerns and obligations under UN conventions are of more importance while refugees and human rights oblige wealthy countries to accept refugees and asylum seekers who are deemed to be genuine victims of persecution. However “economic migrants” may from time to time be excluded or perhaps accepted on a Non-permanent basis to pursue the poorly paid heavy manual and service occupations that the indigenous population do not wish to undertake.

There may be several exceptions for a number of immigrants with capital to invest, or human capital in the form of vocational qualifications, which may or may not be recognized in the receiving country. Most of the Refugees and economic migrants are likely to experience discrimination in wealthy lands. However, the hardest of care for the internally displaced and refugees probably rests on less developed countries in regions where mostly armed conflicts transpire.

Most of the Syrian and other refugee women in Turkey encounter by a greater distance disadvantages while entering the labour market and display lower labour market outcomes, mostly because of lower levels of educational attainment acquired in their countries of origin, which arguably attributed to culturally embedded gender inequalities, which may continue to their disadvantage in the countries of destination. Meanwhile, because of further roles attained such as child-care, refugee women may not always continue relevant trainings, which would contribute to their labour market participation.

I believe that it would be necessary to take into account that further qualitative research is a necessity with refugee women residents in Turkey and/or Europe who are either legally or illegally employed in their countries of destination. First to see if their current professions are in line with their attainments, talents, and furthermore with their expectations and aspirations; and identify further what additional challenges refugee women face when employed in the labour markets of their host societies. Likewise, as another option, measures already taken or being discussed as a response to the aforementioned challenges refugee women encounter from the view of adaptation into labour markets in their particular lands of destination, can either be equal to or in opposition to either local, international, supra-national or European levels.

However, according to international sources there are 1.5 million school-aged Syrian refugee children living in Turkey, Jordan, and Lebanon, but about just half of them do not have access to formal education.

Host countries may have probably taken generous steps to increase student enrolments of primary, secondary and high school students, such as offering free public education and opening afternoon “second shifts” at schools to accommodate more children. But barriers

such as child labor, enrolment requirements, language difficulties and a lack of affordable transportation are keeping children out of the classroom. Children with disabilities are of another great problem faced and most of secondary school age children are also likely to be at exclusive hazard levels. Although refugee related organizations are working to ensure that all of these children can realize their right to education.

Most Syrian children especially ones with **disabilities** may face particularly daunting challenges. Public schools which have a poor record, including Turkish and Lebanese children with disabilities, often reject them because they lack the resources or skills to educate them. While Syrian refugee children with disabilities are able to enrol public schools do not ensure they receive a quality education on an equal basis with others. All Turkish students are legally required to complete 12 years of schooling whilst school attendance for Syrians is voluntary, further complicating the mission to integrate Syrians into Turkish society via the educational system. Reportedly the Turkish government is considering a plan to withhold monthly ESSN support allowances—120 Turkish lira, or about \$22 per family member—from Syrian families whose children do not attend school. This would be a separate measure beyond the withholding of the CCTE monetary inducement specifically tied to school attendance.<sup>3</sup>

Most of the Syrian kids’ education has gone backward. Because I don’t believe most of these children have a brilliant future since they left their country and their homes and presently they don’t even have an education or a future.

Most Syrian families can’t afford to put their children into school in countries such as Turkey, Lebanon or Jordan. They believe all of their children were studying in Syria regularly, but if they would put them in school in countries they fled to, how would they live then? It is because they would have to buy them clothes and pay for transportation. Even if everything was free, the children couldn’t go to school according to major number of Syrian refugees.

However the Turkish Government thinks that granting of Turkish citizenship to Syrian refugees does not begin to resolve the fundamental questions about the future disposition of Syrian refugees in Turkey. They believe that they should determine whether to acknowledge that the vast majority of Syrians will likely remain in Turkey and, if so, it must consider how to integrate these refugees into wider Turkish society. Given the size of the Syrian refugee community, its

---

<sup>3</sup>Serkan Demirtaş, “Turkey wants EU aid as long as Syrian crisis lasts,” *Hürriyet Daily News*, December 1, 2018, available at: <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/opinion/serkan-demirtas/turkey-wants-eu-aid-as-long-as-syrian-crisis-lasts-139344>. Turkish agencies administer both programs, ESSN and CCTE, out of funds provided by the European Union.

lack of obvious alternatives to Turkey and the potential consequences for Turkey of ignoring the problem, efforts at integration appear to be Turkey's only logical solution. Failure to integrate the Syrians could create perhaps new divisions in Turkish society as well as deepen pre-existing economic, religious, and ethnic divisions. But I don't think Granting citizenship in its current, limited scope and pace would likely have little impact on the problem, but there can be better alternatives toward integration that do not involve mass conferral of citizenship.

## Questions

- Why inequality is the cause which creates the conflict and people have to leave their loved place.

Inequality between countries essentially means looking at poverty. Strong link between the wealth of a country and the probability of it suffering from civil war quoted by Researchers such as Paul Collier and Nicholas Samban.<sup>4</sup>

From the other hand, Frances Stewart looks not only at economic inequalities between groups, but also inequalities in social, political and cultural dimensions.<sup>5</sup>

- Economic inequalities include access to and ownership of financial, human, natural resource-based and social assets. They also include inequalities in income levels and employment opportunities.
- Social inequalities include access to services like education, healthcare, housing, etc.
- Political inequalities include the distribution of political opportunities and power among groups, such as control over local, regional and national institutions of governance, the army and the police. They also include inequalities in people's capabilities to participate politically and express their needs.
- Cultural inequalities include disparities in the recognition and standing of the language, religion, customs, norms and practices of different groups.

For mobilization of people to go to war, there must be an issue around which they can be organized. Economic or political inequalities have the

potential to be such an issue, but it is much easier to organize people around it when they are already part of a group and inequalities can be interpreted as a consequence of conscious discrimination against this group.

A good example is provided by Joshua Gubler and Joel Sawat Selway, who describe two rebel leaders trying to organize a rebellion.<sup>6</sup>

One of the leaders is able to appeal to an ethnic group. The group already has a shared history and the leader does not face the problem of having to convince a set of individuals that they are a group. Moreover, this ethnic group may have its own language and norms, which facilitates in-group communication. Once the group has been mobilized, it is difficult for members to leave it, as they cannot simply change their skin colour, family ties or cultural heritage. This increases the rebel leader's capacity to exercise social control. The second rebel leader wants to rally a lower economic class. Creating a shared history and organizing and convincing individuals that they are part of a distinct group is a lot harder in his case. They share their history and language with members of higher economic classes and there is much greater mobility between the classes.

A focus on inequalities between different groups has another advantage. As the figure below shows, the levels of inequalities between groups may be overlooked by data examining the inequalities across a population as a whole. A country may have a highly equal distribution of income overall, but it may be divided very unevenly between particular cultural groups. In this light, focusing on inequalities between different groups draws attention to discriminatory relationships between groups in a society.<sup>7</sup>

To conclude, it would be clear that a wider lens may probably be needed than the purely economic perspective taken by Collier and colleagues. So most of the evidence indicates that when inequalities intersect with ethnic, religious or regional divides, it may create a high risk of civil conflict. Inequalities in societies therefore should thus be taken seriously into account in which it includes looking at the ways where inequalities are addressed, devoting attention to citizenship and property rights and inclusive peace processes, and making sure that reconstruction efforts in fragile post-conflict situations do not ignite renewed inequalities. That will not only lead to more equal societies, but can also prevent war.

## B - Poverty Issues

I think that we do not have much awareness about the Syrian refugees. For instance, how much do we really know about those affected and the resources available?

---

<sup>4</sup>Sambanis, N. (2004) Poverty and the Organization of Political Violence. In: Globalization, Poverty, and Inequality. Brookings Trade Forum. Washington D.C.: Brookings Institution Press, pp. 165-211; Collier, P. Hoeffler, A. Rohner, D. (2008) Beyond Greed and Grievance: Feasibility of Civil War. Department of Economics, University of Oxford.

<sup>5</sup>Stewart (2010), p. 1.

---

<sup>6</sup>Gubler, J. R. and Selway, J.S. (2012), p. 209-11

<sup>7</sup>Cramer (2005), p. 16-17.

Do we have the right information to develop an effective and forward-thinking response? What I believe is that most of these refugees are often omitted from national poverty surveys and other crucial studies, and so are left out of efforts to track the progress of people moving out of poverty.

I believe that we need to Collect poverty data on refugees and migrants, and place this at the centre of decision-making. The inclusion of refugees and displaced people in national poverty surveys would, for instance, ensure that their basic needs are reflected in national state planning and how it is organized and funded.

Strengthening the timeliness of expenditure information by reporting to the international aid transparency initiative carries another importance in political roles to shape the position of the refugees in quality and in quantity. This would enable all development and humanitarian resources, including refugee-hosting costs, to be tracked side-by-side in a timely manner.

Data on refugees and financing still won't tell us the full story. But understanding the poverty of people forced to flee, and the investments needed to help them, would constitute a vital step in the right direction.

### **Poverty of Syrian Refugees**

Syrian refugees cannot apply for resettlement but only temporary protection status under current Turkish law. Thus registering of these refugees for temporary protection status gives access to state services such as health and education as well as the right to apply for a work permit in certain geographic areas and professions. Over a third of urban refugees are not registered.

However an academic survey, which was supported by the University of Istanbul under its Scientific Research Projects unit and conducted by academics from a number of universities, revealed that the vast majority of Syrians in Turkey are employed in unregistered work for significantly lower wages compared to their Turkish counterparts. *Source: Majority of Syrians in turkey employed in unregistered work for lower wages Survey Hürriyet Daily News – LEADING NEWS.*

However compared to the increase in refugees, benefits towards them weren't increased as much as only 712,218 were given residency permits only 56,024 work permits were given to the Syrians by 2017 *Source: Cagaptay, Soner. "Syrian Refugees in Turkey". The Washington Institute for Near East Policy. Retrieved 22 August 2018.*

### **The Status of Syrian Refugees, a Poverty Trap and a Policy Impasse**

The status of Syrian refugees is located somewhere in between two extreme scenarios: total assistance in camps and total integration in host countries. Most of the refugees were accommodated in tents and later on they were scattered around the all geography. Governors of each city registered them according to certain quotas.

Syrian refugees are, for the great majority, assisted outside of camps with cash and food assistance but no shelter or employment and Syrian refugees are in a poverty trap. However, International assistance is low and declining (UNHCR, WFP, NGOs), economic opportunities in hosting countries are few and not increasing, no prospects of return to the country of origin.

The declining welfare of refugees is not likely to serve any interest on any side. It is a threat to local communities, refugees and third countries. So hosting governments are deeply affected by the Syrian crisis and are understandably reluctant to grant greater integration finally The international community and Europe in particular is grappling with an unprecedented migration crisis with no obvious solutions.

### **Financial Aid**

Turkey allocated 30 billion [between 2011–2018] on refugee assistance. *Source: Jim Zanotti, Turkey: Background and U.S. Relations in Brief, February 8, 2019, page 13, Congressional Research Service <https://crsreports.congress.gov/R44000>.*

Over 13 million Syrians received aid from the Turkish Aid Agency (AFAD). Turkey has spent more than any other country on Syrian refugee aid, and has also been subject to criticism for opening refugee camps on the Syrian side of the border. *Source: Syrian Refugees in Turkey: The Long Road Ahead". Migration Policy Institute. Retrieved 3 May 2015.*

Turkey has provided aid also to Syrian refugees so financial aid from other countries to Syrian refugees has been limited, though €3,200,000,000 was **promised by the EU in November 2015**. *Source: Kanter, James (29 November 2015). "Turkey, EU agree 3-billion-euro aid deal to stem migrant crisis". New York Times. Retrieved 14 February 2016.*

In March 2016 the EU and Turkey agreed on the EU-Turkey Statement, which involved a number of political concessions as well as 'another €3 billion in aid, if Turkey agreed to a readmission of Syrians arriving in Greece and tighter border controls.' *Source: Tsourapas, Gerasimos (2019-10-01). "The Syrian Refugee Crisis and Foreign Policy Decision-Making in*



*Jordan, Lebanon, and Turkey*". *Journal of Global Security Studies*. 4(4): p. 464–481.  
[doi:10.1093/jogss/ogz016](https://doi.org/10.1093/jogss/ogz016). ISSN 2057-3170.

Syrians in Turkey include migrants from Syria to Turkey, as well as their descendants. In 2017 Syrian citizens accounted for 24% of all work permits granted to foreign nationals, making Syrians the largest single group of foreign nationals with work permits. Minimum wage in Turkey fixed by Government is fixed to be 422.26 EUR per month as of (Jul 2019).

The most important factors are (1) armed conflict, (2) ethnic intolerance, (3) religious fundamentalism, and (4) political tensions. The influx of refugees, irregular and transit migrations came to Turkey particularly from the Middle East (Iran-Iraq) starting from 1980s.

### Conclusion

I think much more efforts will be required to sustainably and meaningfully address the specific needs especially of women and girl refugees in Turkey. Given the existing patterns of social and economic exclusion that existed prior to the arrival of Syrian refugees from 2011 onwards, a holistic approach that promotes socio-economic development and supports overall social and economic inclusion for all excluded groups is imperative.

The example of the EU Facility for Refugees in Turkey already had several negotiations so the discussion above thus demonstrates that general commitments to gender equality do not really appear to be sufficient. Despite a shift in recent years amongst international donors from a largely humanitarian response to one that seeks to promote resilience and support development, the priorities of donors do not yet appear to fully reflect this shift. Further investigative inquiry into the extent to which both gender and social inclusion have been prioritized – or not – by all stakeholders engaged in the refugee response in Turkey is necessary to shed light on how the refugee response can be made more relevant to these critical socio-economic issues which is global problem too.

The main challenge for critical theory would be connecting theory to practice, thus to be able to set up a theoretical lens that results in a real-world transformative outcome so in this sense it is necessary to argue how Turkey handle the refugee crisis in the country and what challenges they face in return? It is not enough to understand and trace the origins of harm and displacement in the world; it is crucial to use that understanding to reach fairer security arrangements that do not neglect refugees' claims to basic rights. We have to explore what did Turkey offer for security arrangements of refugees in the country?

When you really wish to pursue a critical line of inquiry about the refugee 'crisis' who might want to start with Haman and his journey from Syria to Europe

as a mirror image of the current plight of so many people in the Global South. For critical theory today, politics, knowledge and global orders are for people like Haman and should serve the purpose of freeing them from unnecessary harm and unfair or unbalanced globalised interactions. We have to thus explore the methods of handling and solving the refugee crisis handled by Turkey because institutions like the state must be assessed in terms of how they fare in overcoming various types of exclusion vis-à-vis insiders and outsiders. This report's critical theory, is more than other approaches, promises to go deeper in understanding why refugees have to leave their homes. If it is war then we have to know reasons how war is interacted amongst Turkey and countries where refugees flee. This entails producing knowledge about direct reasons (war in Syria or elsewhere and its causes) but also about global structures of power and harm as well as the agents complicit in it (broader geopolitical interests, the workings of the global economy, climate change and its effects over the lives of communities). We should then analyse country facts that influencing flee of refugees in global crisis. Moreover, critical theory examines the moral consequences (what must be done) of Haman's journey and what kind of responsibility others might bear for Haman's plight. It is not important what Turkey offered but it is worth to know the type of methods they used in approaching to handle the refugee crisis.

Cosmopolitan in character, critical theory refuses to see states as bounded moral communities by nature and instead finds in them the potential to protect strangers in need and include them in a broader notion of national interest. In the context of the current refugee 'crisis', critique is directed to the different norms and practices approved by states vis-à-vis incoming refugees. A basic move is to distinguish which ones are and which are not compatible with cosmopolitan duties already enshrined in international law and upheld by many people and organisations in different societies. A second move is to promote civic initiatives capable of consolidating fairer and more balanced relations (solutions to the 'crisis') between those who seek refuge from harm and those who are in a position to guarantee protection from harm. Solutions must be sought in open dialogue, resorting to rational arguments that take into consideration everyone's concerns and interests. Leaving solutions to national governments alone is not an option due to their rather strict position on national interests. On the contrary, a more balanced position would result from the active involvement of civil society, local authorities, European authorities and refugees themselves. After all, Europe is a pertinent case here as it is the home of the European Union – a project that united the bulk of European states in a supranational, and relatively open-bordered, union in which all citizens are legally free to work and live wherever they please within the Union. Clearly, there is an existing framework within European politics to work with to reach a more just solution to the migration 'crisis' than the one advanced

by those nations who closed their borders. The reward for someone following a critical line of inquiry is therefore to understand to the full that theory is always implicated in practice and that the way we conceive the refugee 'crisis' shapes the kind of solution. To sum up we have to explore the causes of refugee flow due to wars we have to envisage for it. From a critical perspective, then, there is only a true solution to this 'crisis' when political actors embrace cosmopolitan criteria that balance the whole range of interests and respect the rights of everyone involved.

Finally it would help us to know the whole range of interest of Turkey in receiving of refugees and what methods they used in handling it.

## References

1. Jim Zanotti, Turkey: Background and U.S. Relations In Brief, Congressional Research Service February 8, 2019, p. 13.
2. Sambanis, N. (2004) Poverty and the Organization of Political Violence. In: Globalization, Poverty, and Inequality. Brookings Trade Forum. Washington D.C.: Brookings Institution Press, p. 165-211.
3. Collier, P. Hoeffler, A. Rohner, D. (2008) Beyond Greed and Grievance: Feasibility of Civil War. Department of Economics, University of Oxford.
4. Holmqvist, G. (2012) Inequality and Identity: Causes of War? Discussion Paper 72, Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, Uppsala, p. 11.
5. Cited in: Stearns, Jason (2012) From CNDP to M23: The Evolution of an Armed Movement in Eastern Congo. London/Nairobi: Rift Valley Institute, p. 20.
6. OECD (2012) Perspectives on Global Development 2012: Social Cohesion in a Shifting World. OECD Publishing, p. 58.
7. Morin, R. (2012) Rising Share of Americans See Conflict Between Rich and Poor. Washington D.C.: Pew Research Center.
8. Collier, P. and Hoeffler, A. (2004) "Greed and Grievance in Civil War." in: Oxford Economic Papers. 56(4): 563-595, p. 577.
9. Cramer, C. (2005) Inequality and Conflict: A Review of an Age-Old Concern. United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, Programme Paper 11, p. 11.
10. Gubler, J.R. and Selway, J.S. (2012) Horizontal Inequality, Crosscutting Cleavages, and Civil War. In: Journal of Conflict Resolution. 56(2): 206-232, p. 209.
11. Stewart, F. (2000) Crisis Prevention: Tackling Horizontal Inequalities. Oxford Development Studies. 28(3): Stewart, F. (2008) Horizontal Inequalities and Conflict: Understanding Group Violence in Multiethnic Societies. New York: Palgrave Macmillan. p. 245–263.
12. Stewart and Brown, cited in Stewart, F. (2010) Horizontal Inequalities as a Cause of Conflict: A Review of CRISE Findings. World Development Report 2011 Background Paper, p. 3.
13. Cederman, L. Weidmann, N. and Gledditsch, K.S. (2010) Horizontal Inequalities and Ethno-Nationalist Civil War: a Global Comparison. Paper prepared for presentation at Yale University, April 2010, p. 29.
14. Østby, Gudrun (2008) Polarization, Horizontal Inequalities and Violent Civil Conflict. In: Journal of Peace Research. 45(2), p. 155.
15. Cederman, Weidmann and Gledditsch (2010), p. 29.
16. Jok, J.M. Sudan. Race, Religion, and Violence. Oxford: One World Publications, (2007) p. 115.
17. International Poverty Centre, UNDP, 2006, What is Poverty? Concepts and Measures, Poverty in Focus. What is Poverty? Who asks? Who answers? by Robert Chambers, Institute of Development Studies, Sussex, UK: p. 3-23.
18. Pareek M, Watson JP, Ormerod LP, et al: Screening of immigrants in the UK for imported latent tuberculosis: a multicentre cohort study and cost-effectiveness analysis. Lancet Infect Dis 2011;11: p. 435-444.
19. Veldhuijzen IK, Toy M, Hahné SJ, et al: Screening and early treatment of migrants for chronic hepatitis B virus infection is cost-effective. Gastroenterology 2010; 138:522- p. 530.
20. Kanter, James (29 November 2015). "Turkey, EU agree 3-billion-euro aid deal to stem migrant crisis". New York Times. Retrieved 14 February 2016.
21. Kärki T, Napoli C, Riccardo F, et al: Screening for infectious diseases among newly arrived migrants in EU/EEA countries - varying practices but consensus on the utility of screening. Int J Environ Res Public Health 2014; 11:11004-11014.
22. Şimşek, Zeynep, Nebiye Yentur Doni, Nese Gül Hilali & Gokhan Yildirimkaya. 2017. "A community-based survey on Syrian refugee women's health and its predictors in Sanliurfa, Turkey." Women Health: p. 1-15.



23. Tolunay, Harun Egemen, Sait Coşkun Özcan, Yavuz Emre Şükür, Deniz Özarslan Özcan, Fatih Mehmet Adibelli & Neşe Gül Hilali. 2016. “Changes of intraocular pressure in different trimesters of pregnancy among Syrian refugees in Turkey: A cross-sectional study.” *Turkish Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology* 13(2): p. 67-70.
24. Tsourapas, Gerasimos (2019-10-01). “The Syrian Refugee Crisis and Foreign Policy Decision-Making in Jordan, Lebanon, and Turkey”. *Journal of Global Security Studies*. 4(4): p.464–481. doi:10.1093/jogss/ogz016. ISSN 2057-3170.
25. World Bank (2015). Good Jobs in Turkey. World Bank Publication, Washington DC.
26. Özvarış. 2015. Savaş ve Çatışma Ortamında Kadın Sağlığı. [Women’s Health in War and Conflict Environments] TTB Publications, STED Vol.: 24, Nr: 6, p. 237-244.
27. UNHCR (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees) (2014). “UNHCR Global Trends 2014: World At War.”

#### About the Author



*\*Professor Dr Kemal Yıldırım teaches at European School of Law and Governance in Kosovo. He has published more than 200 books and 100 articles in peer journals. He is also a film director and film producer with more than twenty feature films and documentaries. He can be reached by email: [conflictresearch@yahoo.com](mailto:conflictresearch@yahoo.com)*

# THE VALUE OF ENTERPRISE INCUBATOR AND THE SPECIALIZED ECONOMIC GROWTH CENTERS TO CAMBODIA AS AN UNDERDEVELOPED COUNTRY

Dr Chey Tech\*

*Doctor of Philosophy, St Clements University Turks & Caicos Islands*

The complete version of this summarised article is available at:  
<http://www.stclements.edu/Articles/EconomicGrowth.pdf>

## Abstract

In response to the knowledge gap that practitioners and researchers face, this study was conducted in order to contribute information as to how social enterprises in Cambodia exhibit entrepreneurial orientation (EO) in their pursuit of their social and economic missions.

Informed by desk research data and primary data collected from key informant interviews (KIIs), survey questionnaires, and event attendance, this research identifies and maps actors that provide tech innovation support programs, services and supplies.

Results from the study show that Cambodia has significant implications on current understandings of EO and its manifestation in social contexts. Social entrepreneurs in Cambodia are found to be highly innovative in developing solutions to their social problems and finding ways to target their beneficiaries. Furthermore, they are willing to take on steep financial and personal risk, although averse to risks that may jeopardize social impacts.

Without analyzing competitiveness of the landscape, which is beyond the scope of this study, this research recommends investing in innovation facilities, sharing of learnings to improve incubation processes, invest in equal opportunities for social innovations, minding the mentoring gaps, building founder tenacity, and leveraging regional opportunities for local investments.

**Keywords:** *Entrepreneurial Orientation, Business Incubation, Technology Hubs, Tech Innovation Centers, Social Enterprises, Commercial Enterprises.*

## 1. Introduction

In this globalized 21<sup>st</sup> century, incubation program is a vital element in economic development in both developed and developing countries as well as in achieving the Sustainable Development Goal 2030 (SDG 2030).

To most development partners and other funding organizations, they *define social and commercial enterprises as business incubators* that are assisted by some partner organizations or development agencies in order to create new enterprises by providing them with a comprehensive and integrated range of services.

The social enterprise sector in Cambodia is part of this vision. It is extremely different from what we expect to see in more developed regions, where much of the social enterprise literature is originating. Social enterprises in Cambodia, which are mostly the beneficiaries of business incubation program in the country, are being primarily brought forth by NGOs in an effort to diversify revenue streams in response to the country's shifting funding landscape.

In order to realize the said vision and targets set above, the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) has embraced several strategies such as: (a) mobilizing and attracting foreign investments; (b) developing and modernizing small and medium enterprises thru social enterprises and business incubation; (c) revisiting the regulatory environment to strengthen country competitiveness; and (d) coordinating the supporting policies to enhance the development of "economic growth centers" and "economic poles," where activities such as development of platforms, modules or processes under the Skills or Digital outreach through the respective ecosystem in the areas. (RGC, 2015).

Comprehending the entrepreneurial orientation of social entrepreneurs in Cambodia means studying the way in which social entrepreneurs are exhibiting risk, innovativeness, pro-activeness, and persistence in the pursuit of their economic and social missions.

This study is about more than just "success" and "failure." It goes beyond these factors to present the anatomy of a business incubator, and what role, if any, government and culture play in its formation and sustainability.

## 2. Methodology

A mixed methods research design has been used to explore and effectively answer the research questions, as well as to reach more reliable conclusions on the value of enterprise incubators and the specialized economic growth centers or economic poles to Cambodia as a country undergoing transition from being "underdeveloped" to that of "developing" economy.

This study has also assessed the current landscape of the tech innovation sector, in two growth centers in Cambodia: Phnom Penh and Siem Reap, to identify the

needs and opportunities for support programs. In assessing the sector, analysis have been undertaken on the changes in the tech innovation landscape in the two (2) growth centers of Cambodia including entrants, significant factors that have contributed to growth, funding mechanisms, popular modalities, and programs using both secondary data and primary data.

The mixed methodology comprised of secondary data research through Google research, as well as primary research thru the use of semi-structured in-depth research interviews paired with a quantitative survey (in Likert-scale instrument), using convenience sampling technique and quota sample. Focus group discussions were also undertaken, with limited participants because of COVID 19 pandemic.

On the other hand, the qualitative semi-structured Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) have also been conducted to provide rich and meaningful insights into the perceptions surrounding the complex innovation and entrepreneurship ecosystem in social and commercial enterprises and business incubators in Cambodia. Both comparative and contrasted conclusions have been drawn from the KIIs, with participants underscoring both negative and positive dimensions of the innovation and entrepreneurship ecosystem. These KIIs have targeted at least ten (10) informants such as CEOs, directors, experts, startup founders, and entrepreneurs based in Phnom Penh. These elite Key Informant Interviews were undertaken on a face-to-face, despite the COVID 19 pandemic, so that observation can be made on the environment and contexts of their businesses and organizations. However, standard protocols to protect the safety of the person interviewed, the researcher and his assistant were considered and observed during the entire research process.

Both the interviews and the surveys have relied mostly on the managerial perceptions of the respondents on their organization's entrepreneurial orientation (EO) as a business incubator. An email has been sent to prospective respondents in advance in order to help respondents prepare for the interview. Follow-up telephone calls were made to confirm the date and time of the scheduled interviews and surveys.

### 3. Summary of Findings

Marked by high levels of dependency, Cambodia is currently seeing social enterprises gain attraction in the effort to tackle various social and environmental issues. With strong linkages between EO and firm-level performance, understanding how this firm-level strategic orientation manifests itself within social and development contexts is relevant to academics and practitioners alike.

The three salient dimensions of EO, innovativeness, pro-activeness, and risk taking proved to be relevant in non-NGO affiliated social enterprises in Cambodia. Quantitatively speaking, findings of the study support the assertion that non-NGO affiliated social enterprises compete equally on all dimensions of entrepreneurial

orientation with their commercial enterprise counterparts. Statistically speaking, no significant difference was found between the two groups, meaning that there is no evidence to support the idea that commercial entrepreneurs in Cambodia are any more innovative, proactive, persistent, or willing to take risks than social entrepreneurs. In fact, the mean of the summative EO score and the medians from all summative sub-dimension scores show that social enterprises demonstrate higher levels of EO than commercial entrepreneurs in the area.

While social entrepreneurs in Cambodia were able to demonstrate innovativeness on all of the same fronts as commercial entrepreneurs, due to their social missions, they were exposed to additional realms in which to innovate. Formal innovation processes and techniques were lacking in both social and commercial enterprises; entrepreneurs seemed to act in innovative ways, yet avoid the formal commitment to research and development or formalized approaches to creative idea development. Technological innovation also proved to be an area that lacked momentum in both social and commercial entrepreneurial groups. Some of the advantages of innovating, however, perhaps are weakened by contextual considerations in Cambodia, such as the feeble existence of intellectual property laws and regulations or delays in market readiness.

Social entrepreneurs in the study displayed the willingness to take substantial personal and financial risks, particularly at the onset of enterprise development. Hence, it is often difficult to measure and evaluate the social impacts that are fulfilled, and consequently, difficult to gauge 'missed opportunities' or losses in achieving desired results.

The dimension of proactivity is somewhat transformed in the highly unpredictable environmental of Cambodia. Typically, proactivity is thought to encompass an opportunity-seeking and forward-looking perspective, the ability to anticipate future demand, and the introduction of products and services ahead of competition.

Furthermore, the concept of demand becomes binary in some social enterprise settings; demand can exist from beneficiary groups as well as from customers.

In addition to exploring the dimensions of EO and their manifestation in social enterprises, this study represents the first of its kind to begin to consider social enterprise organizational structure and business model in relation to EO. Responding to calls for a better understanding of the demonstration of entrepreneurial orientation in social contexts, this research explored the manifestation of the proposed EO model in social enterprises operating in Cambodia. Furthermore, research confirms that social entrepreneurs in Cambodia were willing to take on steep financial and personal risk, although averse to risk that may diminish their social impact.

Lastly, a progressive approach was taken to the analysis of EO within social enterprises, incorporating how internal business model and organizational structure plays into the manifestation of EO. Results confirm that the Work Integration, Market Intermediary, Entrepreneurial Support, and Low-Income Clients models moderate EO in distinctive ways.

#### **4. Conclusions and Recommendations**

The tech innovation sector in Cambodia has succeeded in crafting a positive attitude toward technology innovation and entrepreneurship among young and early career Cambodians.

##### **Investing in Innovation Facilities**

Living labs are essential for innovation. A few university-based innovation centers have opened, but many lack accesses to even basic equipment.

##### **Breaking the Barriers**

Some actors have jumped on the “innovation bandwagon” by creating new innovation spaces and programs without a clear purpose. Supporting innovation and entrepreneurship is not a zero-sum game. A much-needed collaboration is the sharing of learnings for the improvement of the incubation processes to help reduce risk of failure for the startup teams.

##### **Investing in Equal Opportunities**

On the gender front, efforts have been made in identifying specific barriers that prevent girls and women from becoming fully engaged in technological innovation. Additional efforts are needed for creation of a culture that is inclusive in the workforce, and that will translate into how women create products.

##### **The Mentor Gaps**

Mentoring is not a replacement for teaching and, at a bare minimum, mentoring support should be provided in a language and format that the startup teams are comfortable in learning. Thus, education and training, part of which comes from formal education, and other come from peer-learning, have to be considered.

##### **Building Persistence**

In the Cambodian context, building persistence is becoming more prominent. Cambodia social norms, especially the face- saving culture, make it a taboo to openly admit and discuss failures unless the person has already become successful and the failure was a distance in the past.

##### **Understanding Regional Opportunities**

It takes a village to raise a startup, but in Cambodia’s case, it takes the entire virtual village to do so. Idea-stage support programs are saturated, and their effectiveness in helping to reduce risks of failures for new ventures needs to be evaluated. Only a few Phnom

Penh-based initiatives are offering supports for early-stage and growth stage ventures, all of which are focused on specific themes or beneficiary group.

Entrepreneurs need to understand what opportunities are applicable for them. Investors need to understand that startups need those who are not simply injecting money but are keen and able to help young entrepreneurs along the way.

#### **References**

Acs, Z. J., Desai, S., & Hessels, J. (2008). Entrepreneurship, economic development and institutions. *Small business economics*, 31(3), 219-234.

Balta, M. E., Darlington, C., Smith, S. L., & Cornelius, N. (2012). Entrepreneurial orientation and social innovation practices in social enterprises: The rhetoric and reality. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(17).

Cambodia intellectual property laws & regulations update 2015 | Lexology. (2015, March 4). Retrieved September 25, 2016, from <http://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=f3634aa5-d093-4f16-97ea-c3863ad3be4e>

Darko, E., & Koranteng, K. (2015). Social enterprise landscape in Ghana (British Council Ghana). Accra: British Council Ghana.

Defourny, J., & Kim, S. Y. (2011). Emerging models of social enterprise in Eastern Asia: a cross-country analysis. *Social Enterprise Journal*, 7(1), 86-111.

Elliott, K. A., & Freeman, R. B. (2003). *Can labor standards improve under globalization?* Washington D.C.: Peterson Institute Press.

Halim, H. (2016, July 4). Driving force behind Cambodia’s budding inno-tech market. *The Phnom Penh Post*. Retrieved September 25, 2016, from <http://www.phnompenhpost.com/post-plus/driving-force-behind-cambodias-budding-inno-tech-market>

Kaefer, F., Roper, J., & Sinha, P. (2015). A software-assisted qualitative content analysis of news articles: Example and reflections. *InForum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 16 (2).

Lee, S. M., & Lim, S. (2009). Entrepreneurial orientation and the performance of service business. *Service business*, 3(1), 1-13.

Luke, B., & Chu, V. (2013). Social enterprise versus social entrepreneurship: An examination of the ‘why’ and ‘how’ in pursuing social change. *International Small Business Journal*, 31(7), 764-784.

Lumpkin, G. T., & Dess, G. G. (1996). Clarifying the entrepreneurial orientation construct and linking it to performance. *Academy of Management Review*, 21(1), 135-172.

Lyne, I. (2012). Social enterprise and social entrepreneurship as models of sustainability for local NGO's: Learning from Cambodia. *International Journal for Management Research*, 2(1), 1-6.

Martin, R. L., & Osberg, S. (2007). Social entrepreneurship: The case for definition. *Stanford social innovation review*, 5(2), 28-39.

Prahalad, C. K. (2006). *The fortune at the bottom of the pyramid: Eradicating poverty through profits*. Upper Saddle River, N.J: Wharton School Pub.

Ridley-Duff, R., & Bull, M. (2015). *Understanding social enterprise: Theory and practice*. Sage Publications.

Roberts, D., & Woods, C. (2005). Changing the world on a shoestring: The concept of social entrepreneurship. *University of Auckland Business Review*, 7(1), 45- 51.

Sanchez, L. M., & Nagi, R. (2001). A review of agile manufacturing systems. *International Journal of Production Research*, 39(16), 3561-3600.

Santos, J. R. A. (1999). Cronbach's alpha: A tool for assessing the reliability of scales. *Journal of extension*, 37(2), 1-5.

Sharifi, H., & Zhang, Z. (2001). Agile manufacturing in practice- Application of a methodology. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 21(5/6), 772-794.

Siem Reap province - Cambodia travel guides. (2016). Retrieved September 25, 2016, from Tourism of Cambodia, <http://www.tourismcambodia.com/travelguides/provinces/siem-reap.htm>

Social Enterprise Cambodia. (2016). About Social Enterprise Cambodia. Retrieved March 30, 2016, from <http://socialenterprisecambodia.org/>

Zinga, A. C., Coelho, A. F. M., & Carvalho, F. M. P. O. (2013). Clustering of Angolan entrepreneurs: an analysis of their entrepreneurial posture. *International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal*, 9(4), 483-500.

## About the Author



*\*Dr Chey Tech has a Doctor of Philosophy degree from St Clements University in Turks & Caicos Islands-British West Indies. He also holds a Master of Science (MSc.) degree in Rural Development from the International University and a Bachelor of Science in Animal Health and Production from the Royal University of Agriculture (RUA). In terms of his professional career, he has been employed with the Cambodian Center for Study and Development in Agriculture (CEDAC), Adventist Development and Relief Agency (ADRA), Winrock International, Demand for Good Government (DFGG) of World Bank, Trade Development Support Program (TDSP) of World Bank, and Asian Development Bank (ADB). He also currently provides consultancy services in the areas of project planning, monitoring and evaluation design, social research, project mid-term and final evaluation, project development and management, and other studies for various organization including the local and international NGOs, Development Partner, UN Agencies, and Government Institutions. He may be reached at his Mobile/Telegram/WhatsApp: +855-12 829 500, E-mail: [cheytech2012@gmail.com](mailto:cheytech2012@gmail.com)*

---

*The complete version of this summarised article is available at:*  
<http://www.stclements.edu/Articles/EconomicGrowth.pdf>

# ISSUES IN TECHNICAL WRITING PRESENTATION AND SUPERVISION

**Dr Udeh Sabastine Onyemaechi\***  
(*Enugu State Polytechnic, Iwollo*)

**Udeh Nkemdilim Virginia**  
(*Dept of Accountancy Esut, Enugu*)

## ABSTRACT

This paper covers major areas involved in project writing and technical report presentation. The aim is to acquaint students, project supervisors in various institutions and managers writing technical reports on the latest styles and methodologies of technical report presentation. Project writing is an important subject in modern academia and it is expected that for students to be successful future research scientists, they should be conversant with modern research doctrines, styles and methodologies. When we consider the students population in various institutions, it becomes possible that Lecturers who are not strong in the subject of research can be involved in project supervision, thereby leading to discordant tunes in project assessment. The work started from researchable topic identification up to the doctrinal values guiding abstracts, introduction, literature review, methodology, data presentation, discussion of results, recommendations and end of work referencing and bibliography. It will be of immense benefit to students, their supervisors and PhD aspirants who usually get perplexed by the numerous corrections Professors point out in their seminar papers.

### a. Presentation of Project Proposal

Each student is required to write a brief summary of the chosen topic in three chapters, introducing the project and its objectives, a brief review of related literature and the intended methodology which will be followed to arrive at the stated objectives. Such presentation is done in the presence of a large audience to widen the scope of critical assessment for a better final work.

### b. Project Defence

This involves the students' defence of their final work, if the supervisor confirms the students' readiness to defend his project to prove beyond reasonable doubt that the work is truly his. Such defence is usually carried out in the presence of an external supervisor for added credibility. The supervisor or author of a particular project is free to argue on or defend any point raised if he feels that the suggested correction is not necessary.

## DOCTRINAL REQUIREMENTS

The following areas are important for the purpose of peer review. All projects and to some extent technical

writings, must observe these rules for authenticity and acceptability.

### A. PROJECT TITLE

Academic project titles should not be lengthy, and must convey the idea that the author is searching for a particular truth. It means that research topics should not be implied, leaving the reader to guess what it intends to accomplish before reading the content. The supervisor should decide whether a given title sounds researchable or not before approving the topic. The general guide should be as follows:

Is the topic developing a new idea?

Is it improving an existing idea or

Is it refuting existing idea?

### B. ABSTRACT

The abstract should be a one paragraph, one page summary of the project written in past tense and single line spaced.

### C. CHAPTER ONE (INTRODUCTION)

This chapter among other things must specify the objectives of the research, assumptions and hypothesis if necessary. The supervisor must be referring to these objectives as the work proceeds to ensure that the author limits his work within the stated objectives which must at least be a minimum of two. No reference is required here because this section contains mostly, the author's opinion. It can be allowed in the background of the study. Statement of problem must identify clear problems, which will form the basis of the objectives of the study. Usually, objectives translate to research questions which translate to the hypotheses.

### D. LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature review is important because:

It helps to set up a proper theoretical framework.

It describes how the proposed research is related to prior research.

It shows the originality and relevance of your research problem. Specifically, your research is different from existing works.

It justifies your proposed methodology.



Identifies gaps in existing works in the area of research.

The usual format is that literature is reviewed under the following heading:

#### **i. Conceptual Review**

Illustrates

- a. What the author expects to find through the research
- b. Defines relevant variables for the study
- c. Maps out how they are related to each other
- d. States how the relationship will be studied

Such review must be based on each objective of the chosen topic.

#### **ii. Theoretical Review**

Theories are true statements that are still under review. Authors should also, review the existing theoretical foundations of their work. Example, "The quality of feed, determines the quality of eggs" can be a theoretical statement made by an expert in the field. Others like, "The cheaper the price, the higher the demand", can also be a theoretical statement by a particular author. In like manner, each topic must have several theoretical foundations. The author expected to anchor his work on one of these theories with strong reasons for the choice. Theoretical literature should include: Title of theory, Author, Assumptions, Link between theory and your study and justification.

#### **iii. Empirical Review**

Empirical review involves the review of past works of others in the same topic and their conclusions. Example, the work of XYZ on the same topic arrived at so and so conclusions.

It can be concluded in a tabular form under the following headings: Name of the author, Year of study, Topic of study, Method of data collection and analysis, Major findings and Key recommendations.

#### **iv. Summary of Empirical Review**

The author uses one paragraph or a table to summarise his empirical literature.

#### **v. Gap in Literature**

Conclude your literature review by connecting your work to one or more identified area not covered well by existing work and show the extent your work intends to fill the identified gap.

In all these sub heads, as many authorities as possible can be referred to by the researcher. It is an indirect measure of the depth the author has gone to find out more on the topic in question.

A supervisor must ensure that all references under these headings are the most current and not too old, as

such references must have been overtaken by current events.

### **D. METHODOLOGY**

Methodology will answer such questions as: How an identified objective can be solved, needed data and how it will be collected and the best instrument of data analysis. The answer to these questions will depend on whether the study is a survey, historical or experimental.

#### **Instrument Validity and Reliability**

Validity and reliability are aimed at avoiding the so called type 1 and type 11 errors resulting from research data collection and interpretation.

- a. Type 1 Error: Interpreting correct result as wrong
- b. Type 11 Error: Interpreting wrong result as correct

#### **i. Instrument Validation and Diagnostic Test**

i. **Validity** refers to the extent to which an indicator (or set of indicators) really measure the concept under investigation. **Validity** refers to the extent to which an indicator (or set of indicators) really measure the concept under investigation.

#### **ii. Reliability of Data**

The student is expected to show evidence that the collected data is reliable and most up to date for the topic under study, by showing that the sampling method and questionnaire design is as objective as possible or using test and retest method for consistency. Depending on nature of research;

- a. Some Institutions require that two experts confirm the instrument of data collection.
- b. Further statistical tests can also be used like test of goodness of fit and test for autocorrelations (relationship between past and present value), homoscedasticity (does standard deviations of different samples of same data differ), multicollinearity (in a multiple regression, are versions of independent variables correlated) etc.

#### **iii Ideal Sample Size**

To reduce the inconvenience of working with large samples, Taro Yamane's formula is used to determine the ideal sample size.  $n = N/(1+N(e)^2)$

### **E. DATA ANALYSIS**

Under this head, the student must prove that the statistical instruments of data analysis were the best in all circumstances and when every other thing was considered. If theoretical instruments were used like Regression, variance, etc the question will be whether the student has tested the data for any possible sampling errors or bias like autocorrelation,

heteroscedasticity etc, before interpreting the result and also, whether various results was interpreted correctly.

## F. DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

In this section, the student is expected to discuss the outcome of the analysed data according to the order of objectives/hypotheses.

## G. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

As much as possible, Summaries should be according the objectives, Conclude your final result and make recommendations also according to your objectives. In all, avoid involving what was not studied.

Any recommendation outside the scope of the topic under study is meaningless, because the study did not and supposes not cover such area. If that area is important, it must be the subject of a new study, since scientific studies and *ceteris paribus* or *ipso facto* do not go together.

## H. REFERENCING

Referencing is the method of referring the reader to the source of quoted or referenced materials, in the event that the reader wishes to confirm or investigate further the section in reference. The final referencing or bibliography must start in a new page.

Referencing comes in two ways:

### a. In-text

These are references within the text which the author uses to generate or consolidate his argument, as he writes various sections of the work.

There are various referencing methods in use, APA, MLA, Oxford, Harvard, Chicago, etc. All of them possess various advantages depending on whether the work is a magazine, textbook, periodical, conference papers or technical report.

Each institution chooses a particular style and students are required to follow such style in their writing. In Nigeria, most institutions use the APA (American Psychological Association) style of referencing.

Using this style, the project supervisor should check whether the referencing style is uniform throughout the work and also if the APA format is correctly used in all in-text references. Example, Udeh, (2000) stated that....., Arguing further he (Ijele, 2019) posited that...He insisted that their position is against the popular view, (Agu 2015, p. 1).

### b. End of Work References or Bibliography

It is customary that all technical reports should end with a bibliography of all the in-

text references, including that of other sources consulted (radio, magazines, TV broadcast, internet etc) which, together contributed in the final work or report.

While the in-text contains only the author's name, year of publication and possibly page or pages in reference, the bibliography provides detailed information which will help a reader to assess the source in reference. It usually starts with the authors' name, followed by year of publication in bracket and publishers' name and city, especially for text books. Others like technical reports, periodicals, journal contributions and internet sources may have slight variation. In final referencing, the use of **p or pp** is omitted nowadays.

## I. LIST OF TABLES/APPENDIX

After the references and bibliography comes list of tables, followed by figures, followed by the appendix lettered (not numbered) A, B, C,.

## REFERENCES

Baumeister, Roy F. and Mark R. Leary. (2005), "Writing Narrative Literature Reviews." *Review of General Psychology* 1 (September 1997).

Fink, A. (2014),. *Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From the Internet to Paper*. Fourth edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Frodeman, R. (2010), *The Oxford Handbook of Interdisciplinarity*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Hart, Chris. (1998), *Doing a Literature Review: Releasing the Social Science Research Imagination*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Kennedy, Mary M. (April 2007): "Defining a Literature." *Educational Researcher* 36.

Onwuegbuzie, Anthony J. and Rebecca Frels. (2016) *Seven Steps to a Comprehensive Literature Review: A Multimodal and Cultural Approach*. Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.

Petticrew, Mark and Helen Roberts, (2006). *Systematic Reviews in the Social Sciences: A Practical Guide*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers.

Randolph, Justus J, (2009). "A Guide to Writing the Dissertation Literature Review." [Practical Assessment, Research, and Evaluation](#). vol. 14, June.

Ridley, D. (2012);. *The Literature Review: A Step-by-Step Guide for Students*. 2nd ed. Los Angeles, CA: SAGE.

Sutton, Anthea. *Systematic Approaches to a Successful Literature Review*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, 2016.

UKEssays. (November 2018). The Importance Of A Literature Review. Retrieved from <https://www.ukessays.com/essays/education/importance-of-literature-review-education-essay.php?vref=1>

#### **ABOUT THE LEAD AUTHOR**



*\*Dr Udeh Sabastine Onyemaechi hails from Enugu State, Nigeria. He holds a BA (Hons) and MA in the subject of Economics from Panjab University, Chandigarh, India and also the PhD of St Clements University in the same subject. He is a Director at Enugu State Polytechnic, Author of many books and a Member of numerous professional bodies. He can be reached at [sabastineudeh@yahoo.com](mailto:sabastineudeh@yahoo.com) or contacted on +234-8039373766*

# ANALYSIS OF AFRICAN CULTURAL VALUES AND THEIR IMPACT IN NIGERIA POLITICS AND GOVERNMENT

Dr Frederick Ugwu Ozor\*

PhD, Department of Public Administration, Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki, Ebonyi State, Nigeria

## ABSTRACT

*This paper takes a critical look at the concept of African cultural values and analyzed their effects on Nigeria politics and government since political independence in 1960. Cultural values consist of coherent set of attitudes, behaviors and actions adopted and, or evolved by a person, organization, or society as a standard to guide its behavior and preferences in all situations. African traditional cultural values, cosmology, and philosophical beliefs were embedded in her spirituality, and the unique normative standards were designed to ensure social cohesion and smooth running of the community. The manifestations of cultural changes are deep-seated corruption in most African states as well as in the selfish pursuits by most political leaders.*

*The paper further examined issues of national cohesion, integration and unity, and argued that the actions of the Nigerian political elite since 1960, and in particular their pursuit of parochial, ethnocentric, religious, and material interests, have undoubtedly left the country more alienated and polarized than it was sixty years ago, which in turn, are reflected in what average people do politically.*

*Nigerian political leadership could work towards the consciousness that although Nigeria is an amalgam from the vagaries of international diplomacy, national integration and unity could still be achieved by sanitizing, blending and harmonizing the different cultural values and practices that is geared towards nation building. Contending political groups must make far reaching compromises that ensure equity and justice in the Nigerian federal union.*

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### What is culture?

Culture is about the way of life, the totality of life of a people or society. It describes those traits peculiar to a society which distinguishes it from other societies or cultures, and encompasses a people's language, dress style, dance steps, music, work or traditional occupations, artifacts, religion, philosophical beliefs. It further includes a people's social and political norms, taboos and values or value system. Social or cultural values describe beliefs held about what is right and

acceptable or wrong and condemnable; what is important in life and cherished by a people. It could be an object that is highly treasured or belief about behavior or conduct that is acceptable or praise worthy such as honesty, contentment, etc. Every society has some integrated and structured values, what we call value system (Idang 2007).

Culture is functional as it has instrumental utility: it defines how a people relate to the social, political, and religious objects in their environment; how they combat and evolve answers to challenges posed by their social and physical environment. Bello (1991: 189) in this context argued that culture is a vehicle evolved over time, "by a people in their attempts to meet the challenges of living in their environment, which gives order and meaning to their social, political, economic, aesthetic and religious norms thus distinguishing a people from their neighbor". According to Aziza (2001:31), culture distinguishes a people from others and,

*includes everything that makes them distinct from any other group of people for instance, their greeting habits, dressing, social norms and taboos, food, songs and dance patterns, rites of passages from birth through marriage to death, traditional occupations, religious as well as philosophical beliefs.*

The concept of culture is exhaustive in its dimensions, and perhaps for this reason there are many definitions of culture as there are scholars on the subject. However, two broad dimensions of culture are discernible, namely material and non-material culture. Material culture defines the tangible and visible objects such as arts and crafts and other artifacts including tools and peculiar techniques of production (i.e. the technology) that a people manufacture in order to survive in its immediate environment. Non-material culture on the other hand, comprises of the norms and mores of the people. This aspect of culture, which consists mainly of social norms and taboos, social and philosophical beliefs and values, behavior patterns, etc, is non-tangible, and massively impacts the lives of the people of a particular culture and civilization.

Culture is shared since it consists of cherished values or beliefs that are shared by a group, lineage, and religious sect and so on. Moreover, culture is dynamic,

not static because it is constantly changing (Antia, 2005; Etuk, 2002). Values in fact occupy a central place in the culture of a people, and in this context African cultural values, cosmology, and philosophical beliefs embedded in her spirituality, which seem to set her apart from other cultures and civilizations, have had profound influence on her politics and government over the years. In this paper, we attempted to show how African and in particular Nigerian cultural values in the context of cultural mutations, culture infiltrations or modifications impacted Nigerian politics and government. However, the remaining parts of this work are organized in the following sections: section 2 examined African cultural values and their relevance to the social and political organization of life, while section 3 discussed and analyzed Nigerian politics and government in the context of changing African cultural values. Section 4 examined issues of national integration and unity, and ends with a summary of conclusions in section 5.

## **2. African Cultural Values and their relevance to the social and political organization of life**

Social or cultural values, which are about what are wrong or right, refer to those objects or beliefs held by a people which are generally treasured; they are those points of view or convictions that a people cherish, believe in, live with and are prepared to die for, and overall encompass every aspect of human life. For this reason, we can designate religious, political, social, aesthetic, moral, cultural and personal values, all of which are embedded in a cultural milieu. Though individuals in society may hold diverging personal values (Idang 2007), society has a way of enforcing collectively held values on its members principally through social pressures, sanctions or demands to conform to acceptable ways of behavior and conduct. Life and in fact society tend to compel people to make choices, or to perceive and rate events, actions of others or things as good, better or bad, or even worse using some standard of values. Hence, individuals and society develop some sense of values and scale of judgment. Values shape man's or community's actions, and according to Igboin, (2011:98), values,

*Constitute the standard which members of the community adhere to in their personal and communal interaction towards the achievement of goals. It is they that determine those who are to be praised or reprimanded for their actions. In another sense, values refer to what is 'good' or 'desired'. In the descriptive sense, value can mean the worth of something as when an article is evaluated. Values can be institutional and cherished by individual and by a group of people. Values can refer to the usefulness of a thing which is a function of choice-making.*

Values consist of coherent set of attitude, behavior and action adopted and, or evolved by a person,

organization, or society as a standard to guide its behavior and preferences in all situations (Falade et al., 2009: 482). Thus, in the African context, African communities developed values as a standard to guide their behaviors and preferences, which nevertheless become enduring beliefs that specify mode of conduct of the African adjudged socially positive and preferable to a negative or otherwise opposite mode of conduct.

This centrifugal conformity element of values highlights their important place in the culture and other aspects of life of members of a society. Values in fact occupy a central place in the culture of a people, and in this context African cultural value, cosmology, and philosophical beliefs embedded in her spirituality seem to set her apart from other cultures and civilizations. For instance, distinct from several other cultures, African cultural values are traditionally sacrosanct, approved and supported by their ancestral spirits and often enforced through the mediating force of their belief in the transcendental powers of the gods. Cultural values hold a people together ensuring their continued existence (Etuk, 2002).

Evidence abound in literature to show that pre-colonial African life was largely influenced by religion as nearly almost every aspect of African life was explained and interpreted in transcendental or supernatural terms (Mbiti, 1969; Orizu, 1944). Every institution within the traditional African society was basically religious. Africans had certain normative standards to be observed, which were designed to ensure social cohesion and smooth running of the community and to dissuade members of the community from rebellion that threaten the welfare of the society. In traditional African society these values guided and regulated the behavior of every member.

In fact, there are certain cultural values that have continued to consistently define the African personality, history and belief, and these values have remained critical to African identity, her sociology and politics even in spite of changes found in today's global socio-political and economic modes of life, which seem to massively impact African politics and government. In this context, the African traditional belief in God and the accompanying transcendental values grounded in symbolism through both physical and supernatural forces have tended to be always present in the social and political administration of the society (Igboin, 2011). These persistent social pattern across African societies echoes the presence of God and ancestors or God's agents and their affirmative intervention in the affairs of the living; their presence in the environment and their responsibility in the maintenance of law and order in society. Further, these beliefs and values underscore the spirituality of African life shrouded in her social concepts and philosophical beliefs, which has far reaching political implications. Orizu (1944:198-212) examined traditional African social and political thought and highlighted African social and political viewpoints and value systems. The

author identified cultural values and philosophical beliefs which necessarily constitute the bedrock of African democracy and derivable from and sustained by some indigenous African social concepts such as those of duality of man, mysticism, asceticism, contentment, compromise, right to revolution, individual freedom, and happiness as an end or ultimate purpose of life. The traditional African world view and value system more or less seem to have produced cultural values, socio-political attitudes and behavior patterns consistent with expectations of society and hence tended to assure stable polity and good governance. Overall, these values have tended to shape pre-colonial and immediate post-colonial Nigerian politics particularly in the first Nigerian republic (1960-1967).

In specific terms, what are these traditional African cultural values, socio-political attitudes, and behavior patterns? The African traditional concept of duality of man sees man as consisting of the physical and spiritual aspects, a soul and a body. The immortal soul on death leaves the body to join the ancestral world, from where it intervenes in the affairs of the living, particularly within the immediate family. This ancestral connection is believed to regulate the behavior of family members, who to be great souls, must allow their actions to be governed by motives of probity and moral integrity. Great souls were believed to be able to change the destiny of the living, bring blessings and even avenge evil done to their offspring (Orizu, 1944 cited in Ozor, 2009:330). This concept underscores the value of spirituality of the African as it shapes his entire life.

African concept of mysticism is rooted in self-discipline, which calls for the submission of personal ego to the unity of the family (or the county for that matter), and removes all selfishness in social relations for the general interest, in the worship and will of the ancestors and mindful of the sanctions of the living. This African social concept, which produced socio-cultural value of self discipline, is practical in that it enables the spiritualized human mind to combat nature and align his actions to socially accepted standards of conduct.

Asceticism, another basic African social concept, demands subduing the emotional self to discipline in order to achieve a good and enriched life. This concept emphasizes the socio-cultural value of abstinence, and underscores the search for spiritual purity and discipline that ultimately translates to abstaining from any socially and even politically condemnable and unacceptable behavior.

Contentment in African social philosophy is the belief that ultimate (not temporarily or palliative) happiness derives from the African simplicity of mode of life. The spirit and value of contentment is found in African concept of simplicity, the simplicity of African mode of life. Everything about the African is simple, neither materialistic nor necessarily primitive as opposed to

the so called sophistication of western mode of life, which in its complexity doubtfully leads to ultimate happiness. For the traditional African, happiness results from enjoying what one has and not from seeking that which one has not. In African social philosophy, happiness comes from overcoming one's worries over material things. The essence of life for the African is happiness, but his means to happiness is non-material. It is in fact enduring happiness that is generated from contentment with the few things with which nature has endowed him; material possessions are incidental to happiness. The traditional African is therefore not hedonistic or plastic; in fact he condemns hedonistic or artificial view that the greatest happiness comes from realization of physical pleasures, though he nevertheless holds rendezvous with life and is inclined to enjoy the fullness of life holding onto the natural settings around him (Orizu, 1944).

Other relevant African social concepts include religious, economic and political freedoms. In African social philosophy, religious freedom implies that there is a supreme God and one is free to worship Him "through anything: either through the stars, Christ, or Gandhi or even the Atlantic Ocean" (Oriza, 1944:207). The purpose of religion for the African is to develop a disciplined conscience. Economic freedom on the hand is guaranteed by the immediate family, who on his entering manhood provides him some basic needs from the family's long accumulated recourses for living. Such economic needs may include land, a home, and productive plant sidings such as seed yams, cocoyam, etc that assure him that he is now welcome in society. He is expected to grow with hope and confidence in that society.

What are the implications of these traditional cultural values for contemporary Nigerian politics? First, the African view of democracy inevitably draws from the past philosophical energy that the people can rise up to their 'guardians' As in pre-communist China, Africans have the right to rise up and remove an unpopular government, if it fails to act as a mediator between man and heaven. This revolutionary right of the people, though remote, is an undeniable attribute of African social and political thought.

Discussing chief-ship and politics in Nigeria, Awoniyi, (2015) noted that in the political thoughts and practice of the traditional African society, consultation and consensus were highly valued as they were important features of political decision-making. The practice ensured the involvement of all citizens in the political process. The chief who was the highest political authority, ruled with the consent of and in accordance with the will of the people, and in the actual exercise of power, the people were the sources of authority, directly or indirectly through their representatives on the chief's council. The political authority of the Chief was based on a trusteeship principle that ensured his accountability to the people. Freedom of expression and of political opinion were appreciated and practiced. Misrule by a chief was not tolerated and could lead to



his being disposed. Thus, the African value, which encouraged him to question the status quo, seemed to have fired the energies of the early actors in independence struggles in Nigeria and elsewhere in Africa such as Chief Obafemi Awolo and Nnamdi Azikiwe.

Moreover, the cultural value of religious freedom embodied in African social philosophy actually obliterated religious conflicts in traditional Nigerian politics though to a lesser extent in the immediate post independence politics. The amalgamation of 1914 created a situation that presented a test of the relevance of this value to Nigerian politics. Evidently, empirical data seem to suggest that political contests were centered more on ethnic rather than on religious considerations in the first republic, though today the religion factor appears to be manipulated by the political class for selfish reasons and to further heat up the polity. However, this issue of religious implication for Nigeria politics and government calls for further systematic investigation.

On the other hand, the cultural value of economic freedom meant that the traditional African was empowered economically (except in some autocratic African states) to register his voice and political choices in public affairs. However, today new forms of economic and social production appear to have generated new set of values, new forms of livelihood, and new forms of social stratifications. Consequently, the African of today, and in particular the post independence Nigerian, seems to have lost his traditional spirit of contentment, and self-discipline, and in the craze for material possession, some have become rich, a few wealthy and elitist group, and others are poor and powerless, who constitute a majority of the population. Economic insecurity in Nigeria has meant that a majority is politically disempowered if not docile, apolitical, or even apathetic to the political/electoral process, and so to say remains vulnerable to the manipulation of the political class. Often mesmerized by poverty they sell their voting right to contending political elites even as it were for paltry value. Having sold their franchise, the vulnerable poor loose the moral right and political will and power to question the mismanagement of public resources by elected public officials. Worst still, the uninformed, if not misinformed majority become persuaded by ethnic and chauvinist appeals and propaganda from the self-centered political gladiators. The import of this situation is that colonialism and the concomitant vales change produced new socio-political classes that short changed the political system. The emergence and institutionalization of classes and class struggle in the socio-economic space became dominant factors shaping the political life of the people. In fact colonialism aided a clear emergence and development of classes in Africa. These classes included comprador bourgeoisie, petite bourgeoisie, proletariat and the peasant. The African petite bourgeoisie serve as a mediator, a kind of the conveyor belt through which the colonialists exploited and siphoned the economic

resources of African countries. There is an evident harmony of interests between the African petite bourgeoisie and the European comprador bourgeois. Most of the African leaders or petite bourgeois maintain strong link with their erstwhile colonial masters, and according to Ocheni, and Nwankwo, (2012), this class maintained the long exploitation of the proletariat and the peasant classes. The authors argued that the rampant and complex nature of political instability and socio-economic malaise being experienced in most African states today can be traced to the nature and character of classes introduced in Africa by colonialism.

The economic and other resources of Africa are shared between the petite bourgeoisie and their European/colonial counterparts, even in this contemporary time. The nature of political power struggle and distribution of wealth as well as economic resources in the contemporary African states are a reflection of the understanding and harmony of interest between the African petty bourgeoisie and their colonial partners/friends. The severe impoverishment of most Africans by their petty bourgeois leaders and marginalization as well as oppression of the masses by those who have access to state power are offshoot of colonialism or colonial hang-over among African states. These corrupt political behavioral patterns copied and learned from Nigeria colonial experience have continued to hunt the country even today.

### **3. Nigeria Politics and Government in the context of changing African cultural values**

Empirical evidence tends to show that cultures are not static; they change. Indeed culture needs to change and no society remains static and resistant, and if it does, its culture would not be a living culture. Since culture is carried by a people and people do change their social patterns and institutions, beliefs and values and even skills and tools of work, then culture necessarily cannot but be adaptive. Once an aspect of culture adjusts or shifts in response to changes from within or outside its environment, other aspects of the culture are affected, whether directly or indirectly. These cultural adjustments are followed by parallel shifts in the content and level of cultural value impact on the social and political organization, or structures of life. This has meant that in Nigeria changes from traditional cultural values resulting from influences/legacies of colonialism and neocolonial penetration of Africa have had profound influences on her present day political culture and history. This claim is buttressed by overwhelming evidences in literature which attribute the deep-seated corruption in most African states and the selfish behavior of some of the political leaders to sit tight in office even when they have obviously outlived their usefulness in the eyes of their people to the effects of colonialism and imperialism (Ocheni, and Nwankwo, 2012).

In Africa, traditional cultural values were built around the grand value of ultimate, lasting happiness, which

lies in the freedom to revolt against an unpopular government, in the spirit that is disciplined, in a conscience that is shaped by rationality, in reverence for the family, in adoration and worship of ancestors, in the ability to compromise, and in the spirit of hospitality and contentment that removes covetous tendencies and acquisitiveness. These values ultimately have tended to shape the traditional African social and political institutions and behavior patterns. A good example in Nigeria particularly the east of the country among the Ibos, is the ozo title institution and its purifying and sanitizing influences on the social-political organization and processes of the traditional society. The political impact of these values can be measured in terms of political and social actions/conducts that conform to the will of the gods and sanctions of the living, to the 'rules of the game', and to the principles of good governance. In his public conduct, the traditional African was expected to behave in ways that did not detract from public conscience or attract the wrath of the gods and which did not bring shame and disrepute to the immediate family, the clan, and/or the larger community.

The spirituality of the traditional African social and political worldview more or less produced socio-cultural values that were consistent with expectations of society and assured sane society and stable political process. African traditional societies were consequently free to a large extent from unbridled economic crimes, mismanagement of public funds, the tendency to overstay in public office, election malpractices, and other socially and politically corrupt conducts that characterize present day politics and governance in most African states. In particular, these values appear to have been grossly eroded in modern Nigeria producing thereby several abnormal behavior patterns and tendencies that characterize modern Nigeria politics and government. This seems to explain the several abnormal features found in recent Nigerian political space such as selfish material considerations by the political class, election malpractices including the most recent trend of vote selling and buying in the 2019 general elections, use of political thugs to snatch ballot boxes, and falsification of election results by means of undue influences at the point of collation of results of elections. Today, disruptive and counterproductive competition seems to replace cooperation while aggression seems to have replaced the spirit of compromise of the past.

The political culture and history of Nigeria are shaped to a large extent by socio-political values that progressively became dominant beginning from the days of independence struggles. The traditional Nigerian was visibly political as he actively participated in politics and governance of his community, but changing societal values seem to have placed some limitation on his interests in politics today. A country's political culture reflects the impact of its history on the way people think about politics and their society as a whole, and in the context of political culture and participation in Nigeria, the lack of unity,

national integration, nation building and support for the regime and even faith in the corporate existence of Nigeria seem to have troubled the country since its independence in 1960. Besides, the actions of the political elite since 1960 have undoubtedly left the country more alienated and polarized than it was sixty years ago. That alienation and polarization, in turn, are reflected in what average people do politically, thus adding yet another strain to an already overheated political system.

In this context Anam-Ndu, (2003), argued that governance in post independence Nigeria is replete with many contradictions, controversies, paradoxes and crises emanating from the country's persistently fragile experiment in multi ethnic federalism. These have generated conflicting interests that have over the years lingered unresolved since Lugard forced the amalgamation of desperate and isolated ethno-linguistic nationalities into Nigeria colonial unitary state in 1914. It is therefore established that colonial-imperialism via the political and administrative structures put in place by the colonial state is largely responsible for the form of the federal state as well as the nature of the national integration which Nigeria inherited (Anam-Ndu, 2003).

The division of the country into three regional units turned the federation into an asymmetric territorial association in which one part (the North) was equal to the sum of the other two parts, which are the west and east. Frankel, (1980: 65) argued that though it is true that there is no federal system in the world in which the constituent states or regions are even or nearly equal in size, population, political power, administrative skills, economic development or relative geographical location, nevertheless wherever the obvious differences are as great as to make one constituent unit permanently dominant in collective decisions, it results into unitary centralism rather than a federalism. This inconsistency and contradiction was powerfully advanced by the secessionist Eastern region during the 1967 Nigerian crisis at Aburi peace negotiations as they called for a confederation of Nigerian state that would have given all the regions political and administrative autonomy and equal stake holders in the Nigerian political experiment.

In fact empirical evidence tends to suggest that this structural imbalance generated fear of domination among various groups in the country, especially among the minority ones. In terms of landmass, the northern region then had 77 per cent, eastern region 8.3 per cent, western region 8.5 per cent and the Midwestern region 4.2 per cent. According to the 1963 census figure, the northern region accounted for 53.5 per cent of the total population of Nigeria, the eastern region 22.3 per cent, the western region 18.4 per cent and the Midwestern region 4.6 per cent (Elaigwu, 1988 cited in Ojo, 2005). It was therefore almost impossible for the South given the federal structure as constituted then to control political power at the centre, even as Nigerian politics was ethno regional based. The situation was

compounded by mutual fears amongst the regions: the South feared Northern political domination by population and landmass, while the North was equally suspicious of the Southern advantage over it in terms of skills and western education. Ethno-centric political values thus became dominant and have ever since continued to hunt and shape Nigeria politics and government. Ethno-centric values expressed in tribally biased public utterances, perceptions, and actions of the Nigerian political class actually defined political struggles and contests in the immediate independence era at both regional and federal levels and this trend has continued ever since then. In fact tribal value loaded convictions and orientations found among the political class informed the formulation of first republic political parties: the Action Group for the West, the Northern People's Congress for the North, and the NCNC, even though by its membership the most national in outlook, was dominant in the East. It was ethno/tribal considerations that prevented Dr Nnamdi Azikiwe, an Ibo, as the leader of NCNC that won a majority of seats in Western House of Assembly from becoming the Premier of Western Nigeria following the 1954 General elections. Over night after the elections most of the Yoruba elected members of the House cross carpeted/defected to Action Group and diminished the NCNC majority in the House. Moreover, ethno-tribal sentiments appear also to explain the pogrom/genocide mainly in Northern Nigeria that saw the massacre of over 50,000 of Ibos, slaughtered in cold blood all over Nigeria, and according to the Aharia declaration document (The Principles of the Biafra Revolution) by Ojukwu,

*Nobody asked questions, nobody showed regret, nobody showed remorse. Nigeria had become a jungle with no safety, no justice and no hope for our people. We decided then to found a new place, a human habitation away from the Nigerian jungle. That was the origin of our Revolution.*

The situation is exacerbated even in recent times as political positions at the center became more hotly contested as the stakes became higher. At this point of the political process other politico-cultural values played out, namely the quest for material acquisition/high premium placed on materialism as well as corrupt socio-political values, convictions and preferences found among the political class and in fact the larger Nigerian society, who mesmerized by poverty found escape route via corrupt practices so wide spread in the country to become a cultural norm. To secure political positions particularly at the center/federal level, politicians bribed, maimed, kidnapped, rigged elections, diverted public funds to private pockets, as local Pettit bourgeois maintained close links with their erstwhile European comprador bourgeois in siphoning the country's resources to foreign banks in a context of neo-imperialist exploitation of former colonial enclaves. The political class further used the youths as thugs in political racketing, engaged in massive political misinformation,

in evident pursuit of self-centered interests, mindlessly presented themselves as champions in the propagation of the interests of the masses, and pauperized the masses in order to increase their vulnerability to political manipulation. The situation is even worsened because the larger Nigeria society appears caught up itself by the craze for material possession, which tends to compel it to give social recognition mainly to the wealthy, no matter how the wealth is made. Even those who returned from public offices with clean slates, without corruptly enriching themselves are regarded by their kinsmen as fools or failures in society.

The long reign of the military in government no doubt created the structural problem of Nigerian federalism as in line with its command structure; the Nigeria's federal system became over centralized in consequence. It further re-enforced a noticeable sub-cultural norm in the North that northerners were born to rule, that the Nigerian presidency must necessarily be a Northern affair; the North has a reserved right to control political power at the center, and the tendency implicit in this prevailing sub-cultural norm so to speak, is to reserve the political and top bureaucratic management positions in certain key ministries at the federal level for people from certain parts of the country, notably the North. Alhaji Maitama Sule, a Northern politician opined in the News magazine and echoes this prevalent Northern thinking thus,

*Everyone has a gift from God. The Northerners are endowed by God with leadership qualities. The Yoruba man knows how to earn living and had diplomatic qualities. The Igbo is gifted in commerce, trade and technological innovation. God so created us individually for a purpose and with different gift (the News Magazine cited in Ojo, 2005: 58).*

According to Orluwene, (2018:82), "this kind of conquest and monarchical spirit is an outright negation of federalism" and of course national integration. It would appear that the Northern hegemony of the political scene in Nigeria can be explained in terms of this 'conquest and monarchical spirit', the imperialist worldview of the Northern political class, which consists of coherent set of perceptions, attitudes, behaviors and actions that acted as a standard to shape and define its preferences/choices in the nations' political process. Overall, it may be apt to conclude that Northern regional hegemony has never been denied by the northerners but rather justified or rationalized on very flimsy or various spurious grounds.

Nigeria began with a formal federal constitution in 1954, which was decentralized to accommodate the diverse ethnic groups as each of the constituent federating units, the regions, operated their own regional constitution, police, civil service and judiciary, and even had a separate and distinct coat of

arms and motto, and were allowed to develop at their own pace. The military structured the federation in ways that enabled the federal government to acquire more powers to the detriment of the federating units (Elaigwu, 1998:67). According to Anam-Ndu, (2003), the first coup in 1966 abolished regional police, and though it brought government closer to the people, the creation of twelve states on the eve of the civil war in 1967 entailed considerable loss of power by the federating units. The successive military regimes continued with states creation, and today there are 36 states including the federal capital territory and 779 local governments created by military fiat and military tailored constitutions. States and local governments' creation exercises as well as recruitment into public offices, have reinforced the lopsided nature of the structure of the Nigerian federation, and according to Duchacek, (1977) cited in Ojo, (2005: 56), the feeling that the federation is tilted to the advantage of one of its component units tends to transform the federation into an imperial structure.

The center thus became all powerful and controlled in most part by the Northern military and political establishments. Departing from the dreams and consensus among the founding fathers of Nigerian federation, the long reign of the military/Muslim North more or less entrenched Northern political hegemony in Nigeria. This monarchical or better still, the mentality of Northern hegemony is buttressed by overwhelming evidence in Nigeria political history as well as literature. Out of 7 military heads of State and Government, 5 came from the north. Even the appearance of General Olusegun Obasanjo from the South-west as head of state and government in 1976 was accidental being next to General Murtala Mohammed who was assassinated on 13 February 1976 General Bisala/ Dimka coup. General Obasanjo later handed over power to Alhaji Shehu Shagari who won in 1979 election even in controversial circumstances. When General Abacha lost power by what was regarded in some quarters as divine intervention, Chief Ernest Shonekan another South-westerner was manipulated into office by the Northern military-political establishment to head an Interim National Government obviously to placate the Yoruba who felt alienated by the rather unjustified annulment of June 12, 1993 elections won by Chief M. K. O. Abiola. Besides, the January 15, 1966 Major Chukwuma Nzeogu lead coup, which ushered in General Aguiyi Ironsi, a South-easterner, as Head of state and government, though perceived by the North as ethnic based, was short lived as it was terminated by the July 29, 1966 coup lead by the Northern military officer corps. Once again the Northern military schemed and prevented Brigadier Babafemi Ogundipe who was then the most senior officer in the army from assuming the headship of the military government and choose General Yakubu Gowon instead (Oluleye, 1985: 38).

Moreover, even the Shonekan administration was watered down as it lacked real power and also short-

lived. The annulment of results of the 1993 presidential election, which was won by Chief Abiola and generally acclaimed to be the most transparent election in Nigeria, is seen by many not only as an affront and a fraud but also a clear manifestation of a deep seated arrogance and conviction by the Northern political class that the presidency is entirely a Northern affair.

Goodluck Ebele Jonathan, a Southerner, came to power perhaps on divine grace following the death of Musa Yar'Adua as his deputy. Jonathan's victory in the 2011 presidential election further demonstrates the Northern refusal to accept a Southern political leadership as that election revealed that he had a stronger Southern political support base and a weak Northern support and so more or less regionally lopsided. Further, Jonathan's bid for a second term in office was hotly contested in court principally by the North, and events before and after the 2015 presidential election suggested that the Northern political class was not only uncomfortable with further Southern control of the presidency but also threatened fire and brimstone if General Bahari lost that election. In a show of wise counsel and the gentleman he is, Jonathan accepted Buhari's victory, which was anyway controvertible, insisting that "the presidency is not worth the blood of any Nigerian". In addition to its irritation to Southern control of the presidency, the North too is less comfortable with Southern domination of strategic sectors of the economy, most especially the bureaucracy as at 1997 (Tell Magazine cited in Ojo, 2005: 59). Moreover, it is evident that the South East and South -South minorities are politically sidelined even in appointments to key positions in the federal executive arm of government and agencies. The South East has never had a short at the presidency since 1999.

Religious predispositions, biases, or colorations appear to be another significant value loaded factor that have tended to shape Nigeria politics and government particularly power distribution among the various ethnic nationalities in Nigeria. Ayoade, (1998:88) observed that between 1979 and 1983, in the Second Republic, "countrywide, Muslims obtained about 70 per cent of all executive and board positions".

#### **4. National integration**

Given the pathologies of the Nigerian federalism, the artificiality of its creation, and the impeding cultural values held by both the political class and the masses that bedevil political development in Nigeria, it is evidently clear that these forces negate the development and sustainability of national cohesion, national integration and unity.

In spite of the artificiality of its creation, Nigeria has the potentials to forge the country ahead in unity if the political leadership overcomes its abandonment of the visions of the founding fathers of Nigeria, its cheap and ignoble pursuit of parochial and ethnic interests, its ineptitude, and draws on the historical antecedents of

close interactions and cooperation among the various ethnic nationalities even before Nigerian independence in 1960. The Nigerian political class across the regions could rely on the powers of personal and intergroup relationships to move the country forward towards national integration and unity.

Attempts were made in the past to overcome the seemingly impossibility of integrating the disparate groups of people to form an enduring nation state. Even the colonial government introduced federalism in Nigeria as inevitability not because of cultural diversity but because of great possibilities and potentialities for exploitation of vast economic resources. Unmindful of national integration, it administered the country as if it were two disparate and autonomous communities: Northern and Southern protectorates with one central government in Lagos and failed to lay the foundation for national cohesion and unity.

Nigeria has since political independence in 1960 continued in the search for stability and unity. According to Erim, (2013), the Nigerian colonial experience laid the foundation for the artificiality of state creation and left a heritage of ethnocentricity and divisiveness which constitute veritable obstacles in the search for national unity. The drift in Nigeria political development reflects serious structural and system's weaknesses that produced a whole range of national issues such as feeling of marginalization, the minority question, agitation for separateness/secession, revenue sharing formulae, call for revisiting federalism or restructuring in Nigeria, the Niger Delta restiveness, etc. Overall, the political drift in Nigeria has tended to produce substantial loss of confidence among the citizenry on their country.

Unity of the state system, people and culture is an attribute that requires being consciously cultivated and nurtured and being properly grounded in the people's history and culture (Erim, 2013). Historical antecedents could be powerful cohesive forces to break down ethnic barriers and divisive forces in Nigeria. In fact understanding the past can influence our capacity to shape the present.

Nigerian political leadership could work towards the consciousness that although Nigeria is an amalgam from the vagaries of international diplomacy, national integration and unity could still be achieved by sanitizing and blending the different cultural values and practices geared towards nation building. It further calls for making far reaching compromises that ensures equity and justice for all stakeholders in the Nigerian federal union. In this context, greater interaction and cooperation among the Nigerian elites could promote national integration.

In addition, economic and political restructuring of Nigerian society should be accepted particularly by the North, and this must be directed towards decentralization to reflect equity, justice, and equality among the federating units. Decentralization would

require drastic reduction of items in the exclusive legislative list provided in the 1999 Constitution (as amended) and increasing states' legislative responsibilities in the concurrent list.

## 5. Summary of conclusions

Values occupy a central place in the culture of a people, and in this context African cultural value, cosmology, and philosophical beliefs embedded in her spirituality, have had profound influence on her politics and government over the years.

Evidence abound in literature to show that pre-colonial African life was largely influenced by religion as nearly almost every aspect of African life was explained and interpreted in transcendental or supernatural terms. Africans had certain normative standards designed to ensure social cohesion and smooth running of the community and to dissuade members of the community from rebellion that threaten the welfare of the society. These standards guided and regulated the behavior of every member. African cultural values have continued to consistently define the African personality, history and belief remaining critical to her identity, her sociology and politics even in spite of cultural changes observed today, which seem to massively impact African politics and government.

The traditional African value of consultation and consensus, which were important features of political decision-making, ensured the involvement of all citizens in the political process. Moreover, the cultural value of religious freedom embodied in African social philosophy actually obliterated religious conflicts in traditional Nigerian politics though to a lesser extent in the immediate post independence politics.

However, on the basis of today's new forms of economic and social production, which appear to have generated new set of values, new forms of livelihood, and new forms of social stratifications, the African of today, seems to have lost his traditional spirit of contentment, and self-discipline, and in the craze for material possession, some have become rich, a few wealthy and elitist group, and others are poor and powerless, who constitute a majority of the population.

Economic insecurity in Nigeria results in political disempowerment of the masses that remain docile, apolitical, or even apathetic to the political and electoral processes, and ultimately vulnerable to the manipulation of the political class. Worst still, the uninformed, if not misinformed, majority become persuaded by ethnic and chauvinist appeals and propaganda from the self-centered political gladiators. The import of this situation is that colonialism and the concomitant vales change produced new socio-political classes that short changed the political system. Consequently, the emergence and institutionalization of classes and class struggle in the socio-economic space became dominant factors shaping the political

life of the people. Ocheni and Nwamkwo, (2012) echoes this thinking arguing that the rampant and complex nature of political instability and socio-economic malaise being experienced in most African states today have recourse to the nature and character of classes introduced in Africa by colonialism. The aberrations observed in the political behavioral patterns copied and learned from Nigeria colonial experience have tended to continue to hunt the country even today.

In Nigeria changes from traditional cultural values resulting from influences or legacies of colonialism and neocolonial penetration of Africa have had profound influences on her present day political culture and history. The political culture and history of Nigeria are shaped to a large extent by socio-political values that progressively became dominant beginning from the days of independence struggles. Changing societal values seem to have placed some limitation on the interests of the average Nigerian in politics today.

A country's political culture reflects the impact of its history on the way people think about politics and their society as a whole, and in the context of political culture and participation in Nigeria, the lack of unity, national integration, nation building and support for the regime and even faith in the corporate existence of Nigeria seem to have troubled the country since its independence in 1960. The actions of the political elite since 1960, and in particular their pursuit of parochial, ethnocentric, religious, and material interests, have undoubtedly left the country more alienated and polarized than it was sixty years ago. That alienation and polarization, in turn, are reflected in what average people do politically, thus adding yet another strain to an already overheated political system. Ethno-centric values expressed in tribally biased public utterances, perceptions, and actions of the Nigerian political class actually defined political struggles and contests in the immediate independence era at both regional and federal levels and this trend has continued ever since then.

The development and sustainability of national cohesion, national integration and unity seem to have been troubled by evident pathologies of the Nigerian federalism, the artificiality of its creation, and the impeding cultural values held by both the political class and the masses. The drift in Nigeria political development reflects serious structural and system's weaknesses that produced a whole range of national issues such as feeling of marginalization, the minority question, agitation for separateness/secession, revenue sharing formulae, call for revisiting federalism or restructuring in Nigeria, the Niger Delta restiveness, etc. Unity of the state system, people and culture is an attribute that requires being consciously cultivated and nurtured and must necessarily be anchored on the people's history and culture.

Nigerian political leadership could work towards the consciousness that although Nigeria is an amalgam

from the vagaries of international diplomacy, national integration and unity could still be achieved by sanitizing, blending and harmonizing the different cultural values and practices, which is anchored on nation building, and making far reaching compromises that ensures equity and justice for all stakeholders in the Nigerian federal union.

## References

- Anam-Ndu, E. A. (2003). Renewing the federal paradigm in Nigeria: Contending issues and perspectives, In, Gana, A.T. and Egwu, S.G. (eds.) *Federalism in Africa: Framing the nation question I* Eretria: Africa World Press Inc.
- Antia, O. R. U. (2005). *Akwa Ibom Cultural Heritage: It's Incursion by Western Culture and it's Renaissance*. Uyo: Abnny Publishers.
- Awoniyi, S. (2015). African cultural values: the past, present and future, *Journal of Sustainable Development in Africa*, 17(1).
- Ayoade, J. A. A. (1998). 'The federal character principle and the search for national integration', In Amuwo, K., Agbaje, A., Suberu, R. and George Herault (eds.) *Federalism and Political Restructuring in Nigeria*. Ibadan: Spectrum Books Ltd.
- Aziza, R. C. (2001). The Relationship between Language use and Survival of Culture: the case of Umobo youth. *Nigerian Language Studies*. No.4.
- Bello, S. (1991). *Culture and Decision Making in Nigeria*. Lagos: National Council for Arts and Culture.
- Duchacek, I. (1977). *Comparative federalism: The territorial dimension of politics*. New York: Holt, Rhinehart and Winston.
- Elaigwu, J. I. (1998). *Federal structure for sustainable development*, Ilorin: The Herald. 30 Sept. – 6 October.
- Erim, P.O. (2013). Historical Antecedents and Nation Building: The Nigerian Experience, *Journal of International Social Research*, 6(27).
- Etuk, U. A. (2002). *Religion and Cultural Identity*. Ibadan: Hope Publication.
- Falade, D.A., Akinola O.O. & Adejube ,S. (2009). Proverbs as Traditional Means of Moral and Social; Learning among the Yoruba of Nigeria. In Ajayi, Adegboyega and Fabarebo Samuel Idowu. (Eds.). *Traditions in Black and African Culture*, Lagos: Concept Publications Limited.
- Idang, G. E. (2007). Cultural Relativism and the Language of Moral. *International Journal of African Culture and Development*, 2(1).



Igboin, B.O. (2011). Colonialism and African cultural values *African Journal of History and Culture* Vol. 3(6), pp. 96-103, Available online at <http://www.academicjournals.org/ajhc>

Ocheni, S. and Nwankwo, B. C. (2012). Analysis of Colonialism and Its Impact in Africa. *Cross-Cultural Communication*, 8 (3), 46-54. Available from URL: <http://www.cscanada.net/index.php/cc/article/view/j.ccc.1923670020120803.1189>  
DOI:<http://dx.doi.org/10.3968/j.ccc.1923670020120803.1189>

Ojo, E. O. (2005). Federalism and national cohesion. In Onwudiwe et al (eds) *Nigerian federalism in crisis: Critical perspectives and political options*. Ibadan: Programme on Ethnic and Federal Studies (PEFS).

Oluleye, J. J. (1985). *Military leadership in Nigeria 1966-1979*. Ibadan: U.P.L.

Orizu, N. A. A. (1944). *Without Bitterness*. New York: Creative Age Press.

Orluwene, O. B. (2018). The Challenges and Pathologies of Nigerian Federalism, *Social Science and Law Journal of Policy Review and Development Strategies*, 6(1) | SSLJPRDS ISSN Print: 2315-8387 | ISSN Online: 2354-1628.

Ozor, F. U. (2009). Electoral process, Democracy and Governance in Nigeria, *Politikon, South African Journal of Political Studies*, 36(2), pp.315-336.

## About the Author



**\*Dr Frederick Ugwu Ozor** was a Lecturer at the University of the Gambia where he conducted research in policy studies, political leadership and governance. He further lectured as a senior academic at Caritas University Enugu and Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki. He holds a B.Sc. in Political Science, M.Sc. in Public Administration from the University of Nigeria, Nsukka, and a Doctorate from St Clements University. He is a Professional Fellow of the International Guild of Academicians, South Africa and a Doctoral Fellow of the Institute of Professional Financial Managers, UK as well as a nominee for the award of Fellow of the Institute of Management Consultants. He has served in senior management positions of the Nigeria Education Management Board for several years and authored several scientific journals. Currently he is an associate professor of public administration/policy studies and runs a research and management consultancy firm in Nigeria. Dr Ozor can be reached by e-mail at [drfrederick.ozor@gmail.com](mailto:drfrederick.ozor@gmail.com)

# THE NGO OFFICERS' PERCEPTIONS OF A LEARNING ORGANIZATION AND WORK ENVIRONMENT FACTORS AFFECTING KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER: A FOCUS ON NGOs IN PHNOM PENH, CAMBODIA

Dr Kep Bunly\*

*Doctor of Philosophy in Leadership, Pannasastra University of Cambodia  
Phnom Penh, Cambodia*

## Abstract:

There are some evidences in the literature review that organizational learning (OL) is gaining momentum among non-governmental organizations (NGOs), as a means to strengthen capacity to serve the most vulnerable populations in a context of increasing economic constraints. Following a major operational change undertaken for the past ten (10) years in non-government organizations in Phnom Penh, Cambodia, non-government organizations have been performing their mandate of providing the services to the people and communities that the government cannot provide. One of the needs identified was to become a better learning organization.

This study examines the processes of identifying suitable initiatives for Organizational Learning, wherein the focus were the 31 NGOs operating in Phnom Penh, as well as the findings from and outcomes of those processes, which include the development of a strategy addressing its organizational learning and knowledge management needs.

Conducted from a practitioner-researcher perspective, a mixed-method approach was undertaken including a survey, semi-structured key informant interviews focus-group discussions, and ethnographic/observation study among the officers and staff of the 31 NGOs in Phnom Penh. The purpose was to examine perceptions of the NGOs' performance as a learning organization and implications for the future. In addition, semi-structured interviews were conducted with representatives of NGOs that had a reputation for performing well as learning organizations.

Empirical findings show that in a complex and rapidly changing operating environment, NGOs have a strong incentive to become learning organizations. Factors influencing Organizational Learning and Work Environment include: allocation of resources; developing structures, systems and processes; inspired leadership that acts as a role model; and fostering a culture of learning, including by promoting relevant skill sets and behaviors. Seven categories identified in the literature to classify specific mechanisms such as the Dimension of Learning Organization Questionnaire (DLOQ) were validated by this study and a new

category emerged outlining the importance of sharing the knowledge produced within the organization with the wider sector. Based on these findings, an evidence-informed strategy tailored to the needs of the NGOs was developed.

There is a need for NGOs to proactively engage with the burgeoning Organizational Learning field to achieve optimal programming outcomes and cost-effectiveness. It is recommended that they apply a similar methodology to the one described in this study, including a rigorous assessment process against the categories identified, and the development of a comprehensive, custom-made strategy.

**Keywords:** Organizational Learning, Learning Organization, Knowledge Transfer, Perceptions, Work Environment, Non-Government Organizations

## 1. Introduction

Organizations around the world cannot evolve as stronger entities without developing their greatest assets, their people. Globally, thousands of companies spend billions of dollars annually on training programs just to improve the capacity of their workforce (Hodgetts & Luthans, 2013). However, training in the workplace becomes futile if the knowledge gained by trainees cannot be transferred to the other people in the organization for adaptation for the growth of the organization and to improve everybody's performance and engagement.

Broad and Newstrom (2002) also believed that the employer's investments to their workers are inoperable if the knowledge and skills gained from training were not applied on the job by those who attended the training. In another study, it was revealed that there are only a few organizations that have effectively transferred the technology to the people after conducting the training (Holton & Baldwin, 2000). Non-Government Organizations are no exception to this phenomenon of knowledge transfer.

The training institutes within some NGOs are serving as the core units within the organizations that are harnessing the full potential of its officers and employees' personal, professional, and academic

development (Hunter-Johnson & Closson, 2017). Within these training institutes, there are basically roles being performed: (a) providing formal training for new NGO officers inclusive of technical skills and knowledge base, (b) serving as a mechanism for weeding out those who are either ill prepared or unqualified to become NGO officers, and (c) serving as a rite of passage that initiates recruits into the NGO culture. In addition to these roles, organizational leaders and administrators are encouraging that the course topics being provided in the training program are reflective of the best practices to enhance learning, curriculum design, educational policies, and instructional techniques that are compatible with the educational orientation of their learners.

In this study, the researcher's intention was to explore the perceptions of NGO officers in Phnom Penh, Cambodia on the factors that might impede and/or influence transfer of training, as well as examine their perceptions of the organization as promoting learning practices, learning culture, and a continuous learning environment at an individual, group, and organizational level.

## 2. Methodology

The methodological approaches used in this research inquiry on the validity and reliability of the measurement scores of the learning organizational culture using the *Dimension of Learning Organization Questionnaire (DLOQ), with special focus on at least 31 NGOs operating in Phnom Penh, Cambodia.*

Using mixed-methods research design, the *DOLQ survey was the central tool employed in addressing the research questions.*

*This study was designed to gain an in-depth understanding of the experience and processes involved in developing a strategy for organizational learning (OL) and knowledge management for the 31 non-government organizations operating in Phnom Penh, Cambodia.* It also aimed to identify suitable initiatives to build a better learning organization at the NGO sector in Cambodia based on clearly identified needs and stakeholder aspirations. Throughout this research undertaking, the researcher coordinated with the various NGOs in completing the study.

The overall methodological approach the researcher undertook to conduct this study drew upon *organizational ethnography*. In addition, the design was informed by action research drawing upon aspects of collaborative organizational inquiry, using the DOLQ survey questionnaire, focus group discussion, key informant interviews, and ethnographic techniques such as observation and transect walk procedures.

## 3. Summary of Main Findings

The results from dimensions (DLOQ\_A) of learning organization shows learning existing in organization at a moderate level. Continuous learning, embedded systems, teaching learning and collaboration, and empowerment dimensions receive lower mean score compared to other dimensions. Individual learning is found to be the starting points of team learning and enables the learning at organizational level; especially executive directors are the foundation to support the improvement of team learning in NGOs. Data from regression analysis revealed that individual learning and team learning are the predictors of learning organization ( $F(2,206)=288.195, p<0.000; R^2=0.737$ ). Based on this, individual learning has higher predictor of learning organization than that of team in which individual has 82.8% ( $F(1,207)=452.699, p<0.000; R^2=0.828$ .) while team has 75.6% ( $F(1,207)=275.279, p<0.000; R^2 = 0.756$ .)

Learning is found significant difference between executive directors, managers and officers. This learning different related to training design in and between management and officers in each dimension of learning organization.

The data from qualitative research have found that leaders are concerning about the study capacity building and strengthening skills. This would help increase their subordinate quality of work performance. NGOs leaders seek to support staff through creating organizational climate so that their staff could learn and transfer their knowledge and practices to their peers. More than training, they do follow up and coach staff. Managers, supervisors and staff assured that staff are empowered to perform their tasks and do their own decision making that promote learning practice.

Additionally, organizational culture is found to be supportive in promoting the learning of the staff. The habit of open communication, empowerment, rewarding culture and organizational value are the catalysts. Staff are motivational, and helpful in this atmosphere. The practice of these cultures allowed staff to feel safe and confident to use their knowledge and creativity for their job. Moreover, this environment enabled staff to respects, build relationship and help each other. Relatively, all NGO's staff interviewed noticed their work environment as a place to build their ground for the higher position.

The study found that individual staff are able to learn NGO's values through their daily interaction with other colleagues, especially in NGOs with religious belief. Moreover, the study found that individual staff feel they learn more from the supportive atmosphere, rather than the pressure workplace. They believe their leaders offer this opportunity for them to learn for their creating supportive policies. However, some staff find it challenging for their learning due to their memory ability to reflect the knowledge to the job and the work pressure of individual staff who have workload to

accomplish with some short time frame of the project. In addition, some individual staff find it hard to transfer of their training are due to some other personal issues beside job responsibilities such as family issues or health conditions. Additionally, less follow up or coaching after training is revealed to be another factor to prevent the use of knowledge.

In organization, staff support each other and they work in a team. They noticed that teamwork enables them to learn from the sharing of every individual staff. Through team they could have new initiation in putting to the projects. Also, NGO's staff knows that team could help seek appropriate solution them if they are not able to do it themselves. However, Team and organizational level are found to have some challenges to apply the knowledge for their team or organization or its partners due to the lack of financial package or budget available to implement what was receiving from the training. On the other hand, the staff or team and the organization or its partner NGO are not ready to use the new technology for their work is another factor. For instance, technological tools for online monitoring, data analysis and App or software that is licensed. This is found related to the shortage of time to implement the work and workload of individual and team. Additionally, shortage of work experiences is another point to prevent using knowledge and skills at work. Interestingly, donor personality is identified as one of the barriers for staff to use knowledge from training. The participants agreed that some donor organizations put strict requirements to their NGOs to really follow all the guideline set by them. Another identified barrier of transferring of training is the law. The participant informed that some trainings is not applicable based on the law of Cambodia. Then the training becomes useless.

The findings showed that obstacles of training transfer are due to capacity of individual, work load, time limitation, personal problems, the lack of available budget, not readiness of NGOs to use new technology, shortage of work experiences, donor personality and law of the country. These key factors explain the need for NGOs to improve learning in individual, team or organization as a whole.

The study found that NGOs have a habit that after staff attend trainings they have to provide a short report and explain what contents of the training can be applied and what cannot be applied but this is not compulsory for all NGOs. Another finding revealed that some staff in the organization was sent for training from different units that are not implementing the project after training they are not able to apply what was trained. Additionally, some NGOs sent those who did not attend training to take part in meeting on an important decision making which can be difficult for him or her to have full authority in making decision.

The study denoted the differences in individual degree, age, sex, years of services, rank and posting in the organization. The study found that all NGO's

employees see these differences as motivational, experiential, and supportive to their learning and transferring training for their job. Everyone is comfortable with each other for their communication and interaction which they can build trust. Interview participants noticed about the mix of individuals in a team of their project or units that encourage their performance to learn from the other or share their knowledge to other youngsters to learn.

The study noticed that there is no difference in receiving training or sending to the training between staff in the organization. They have equal chance to participate the training conducted in their project or their partner NGOs. No separation among gender, age or year of services are allowed to join training or using their knowledge at work. The difference observed is training for the management and the staff. Management team is trained with content of the projects, how to manage, and how to adapt it suitable to the country and global context while the contents of training for officers are more on practices.

#### **4. Conclusions**

The conclusions that emerged from this research indicated that subordinates and management did not perceive the organization as one that provided support for transfer of training within the work environment. When questioned more in-depth, the focus group discussion (FGD) participants identified attitudinal factors, such as favoritism, resistance to change, personality characteristics, and learning perceptions as factors that impeded the support for transfer of training. These factors identified were not only influential at a departmental level, but also at an organizational level in NGOs visited. Further, management identified limited training of peers and/or supervisors and perceived lack of value for knowledge as factors that also impeded support for transfer of training within the workplace.

In relation to the officers' perceptions of negative influences to transfer of training, there were three commonalities between subordinates and management related to negative influences. These negative influences included lack of resources, resistance to change, and current job posting (deployment) of officers. The only commonality regarded as a positive influence was receiving management and supervisor support.

Although there were a few officers who did recognize the NGO as a learning organization, the majority of officers identified the NGO as being neither positive nor negative (neutral).

Officers at the subordinate and management levels were specifically asked what other factors within the work environment influenced the transfer of training process. There were four commonalities identified by the groups, including (a) personality that took into account characteristics of the commanding officers and individual officers; (b) operating procedures in the

organization related to traditional versus modern practices; (c) the culture and support of the work environment; and (d) attitudes towards knowledge, including lack of interest in new learning, perceptions of competence based on rank, and beliefs that training is not available.

There were no differences in perceptions by the study variables (rank, years of service, and gender) except for posting at the individual, team level, and overall levels; and officer rank at the organizational level.

A comparison of this study findings with themes identified in the literature shows that a thriving learning organization should be built upon a comprehensive set of enablers and mechanisms covering different aspects and sequences of learning (gathering, sharing/disseminating, reflecting on and using/applying knowledge). This applies to various levels (individual, team, country program, and region, organization-wide) for both internal and external audiences.

Based on these findings, an evidence-informed strategy tailored to the needs of the NGOs. Importantly, a one-size-fits-all approach is not recommended for the learning organization. The building blocks for OL & KM need to reflect and enhance the existing culture, processes and systems of the workplace and the mechanisms identified in these findings and the literature should, therefore, not be indiscriminately implemented as a compliance exercise. They ought to be collaboratively tested and piloted with a representative group of key stakeholders across divisions and adapted to the level the organization is currently operating at, which requires a comprehensive assessment to be conducted, as described in this dissertation.

## References:

Adams, J. S. (1963). Toward an understanding of inequity. *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 67, 422-463.

Amabile, T.M. (1996). *Creativity in context: Update to the social psychology of creativity*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Awoniyi, A. E., Griego, O. V., & Morgan, G. A. (2002). Person-environment fit and transfer of training. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 6(1), 25- 35.

Baldwin, T. T., & Ford, J. K. (1988). Transfer of training: A review and directions for future research. *Personnel Psychology*, 41, 63-105.

Bunch, K. J. (2007). Training failure as a consequence of organizational culture. *Human Resource Development Review*, 6(2), 142-163.

Caplan, R. D. (1983). Person-environment fit: Past, present, and future. In C. L. Cooper (Ed.), *Stress research* (pp. 35-78). New York, NY: Wiley.

Dawis, R. V. (2005). The Minnesota theory of work adjustment in career development and counseling. In S. D. Brown & E. W. Lent (Eds.), *Career development and counseling: Putting theory and research to work* (pp. 3-23). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.

Dowling, P. J., & Welch, D. E. (2005). *International human resource management: Managing people in a multinational context* (5ed.). Mason, OH: Thompson South-Western.

Egan, T., Yang, B., & Bartlett, K.R. (2004). The effects of organizational learning culture and job satisfaction on motivation to transfer learning and turnover intention. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 15(3), 279-302.

Facteau, J. D., Dobbins, G. H., Russell, J. E. A., Ladd, R. T., & Kudisch, J. D. (1992). The influence of general perceptions of the training environment on motivation to learn and training transfer: A structural equations analysis. Paper given at the conference for Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology, Montreal, Canada.

French, J. R. P., Jr. (1973). Person role fit. *Occupational Mental Health*, 3(1), 15-20.

Gardiner, P., Leat, M., & Sadler-Smith, E. (2001). Learning in organizations: HR implications and considerations. *Human Resource Development International*, 4(3), 391-405.

Gilley, J.W., & Maycunich, A. (2000). *Organizational learning, performance and change: An introduction to strategic human resource development*. Cambridge, MA: Perseus.

Hair, J.F., Black, W.C., Babin, B.J., Anderson, R.E., & Tatham, R.L. (2006). *Multivariate data analysis* (6thed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson/Prentice Hall.

Hendry, C., Bradley, P., & Perkins, S. (1997). Missed a motivator? *People Management*, 3(10), 20-25.

Jackson, S. E., & Schuler, R. S. (1985). A meta-analysis and conceptual critique of research on role ambiguity and role conflict in work settings. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, 36, 16-78.

Joo, B., & McLean, G. N. (2006). Best employer studies: A conceptual model from a literature review and a case study. *Human Resource Development Review*, 5(2), 228-257.

Klein, H. J. (1991). Further evidence on the relationship between goal setting and expectancy theories. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, 49, 230-257.

Latham, G. P. (1989). Behavioral approaches to the training and learning process. In I. L. Goldstein (Ed.), *Training and development in organizations* (pp. 256-295). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass

Marsick, V.J., & Watkins, K. E. (2003). Demonstrating the value of an organization's learning culture: The dimensions of learning organizations questionnaire. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 5(2), 132-151.

Morrow, T. (2001). Training and development in the Northern Ireland clothing industry. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 25(2), 80-89.

Noel, T. (1997). *The effects of learning goals on group performance on an independent task* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (AAT 9812911)

Palthe, J., & Kossek, E. E. (2003). Subcultures and employment modes: Translating HR strategy into practice. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 16, 287- 309.

Pritchard, R. D. (1969). Equity theory: A review and critique. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 4, 176-211.

Rouiller, J. Z., & Goldstein, I. L. (1993). The relationship between organizational transfer climate and positive transfer of training. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 4(4), 377-90.

Santos, A., & Stuart, M. (2003). Employee perceptions and their influence on training effectiveness. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 13, 27-45.

Sheridan, J. E. (1992). Organizational culture and employee retention. *Academy of Management Journal*, 35, 1036-1056.

Tannenbaum, S. I., & Yukl, G. (1992). Training and development in work organizations. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 43, 399-441.

Tice, C. (2007, February). Building the 21<sup>st</sup> century leader. *Entrepreneur Magazine*, 64- 69.

Urdan, T. C. (2005). *Statistics in plain English* (2nd ed.). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

Vroom, V. (1964). *Work and motivation*. New York, NY: Wiley.

Watkins, K.E., & Marsick, V.J. (1997). *Dimensions of the learning organization*. Warwick, RI: Partners for the Learning Organization.

Yang, B., Watkins, K., & Marsick, V.J. (2004). The construct of the learning organization: Dimensions, measurement, and validation. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 15(1), 31-55.

Yamhill, S., & McLean, G. N. (2001). Theories supporting transfer of training. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 12(2), 195-208.

Yu, G.C., Park, W.S., & Kim, D.O. (2001). Changing patterns of human resource management systems in Korea: Evidence from 1998-2000 panel data. *Proceedings of the Korean Association of Personnel Administration International Conference*. Seoul, Korea.

Zhang, D., Zhang, Z., & Yang, B. (2004). Learning organization in mainland China: Empirical research on its application to Chinese state-owned enterprises. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 8 (4), 258-273.

#### About the Author



**\*Dr Kep Bunly** has a Doctor of Philosophy in Leadership degree from Pannasastra University of Cambodia. He currently works as a Professorial Lecturer at University of Cambodia and as a freelance consultant in the area of project evaluation and socio-economic research. He also provides technical support as Vice-Dean to the Institute of Police Science Research of the Police Academy of Cambodia at the Ministry of Interior. His previous involvement includes consultancy work at Dan Church Aid (DCA) where he managed and coordinated innovative projects; and other organizations such as Save Cambodia's Wildlife, Cambo Dhhra, Farmer Network and Net (FNN) and the National Institute of Social Affairs (NISA). He may be reached at [kep.bunly@gmail.com](mailto:kep.bunly@gmail.com)



# ANALYTICAL STUDY ON FACTORS AFFECTING RETURN ON INVESTMENT TO TECHNICAL, VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN CAMBODIA

Dr Sok Chanrithy\*

*Doctor of Business Administration, Pannasastra University of Cambodia Phnom Penh, Cambodia*

## ABSTRACT

Rate of return analysis has been used as a technique in assessing the economic viability of the education sector internationally (World Bank, 1996; Wood hall, 2004) but with limited attention to the technical sub-sector of education. In order to fill the research gap, this study seeks to examine and analyze the various factors affecting the economic and financial returns to technical vocational education and training (TVET).

The overall purpose of this paper is to examine the various factors affecting the return on investment to TVET in Cambodia and in determining the level of industries' participation in the country's TVET system. The study was conducted in order to: (i) discover the opinions and perceptions of Cambodian employers, teachers, students and other professionals regarding technical, vocational, education and training (TVET); (ii) determine the direct private cost of obtaining different levels of TVET among skilled technical workers in the manufacturing companies in the various regions in Cambodia; (iii) estimate the rate of returns at the individual of investment in TVET based on the earnings generated by the graduates from employment; and (iv) compare the rates of return at individual of investment in TVET on the various types of employment of skilled technical workers.

In our study, several informative documents, research reports, and other literature were carefully reviewed on the return on TVET investments as well as partnership activities between the private sector industries and the TVET public sector and institutions of learning. Some issues regarding the TVET system that lead to the industry engagement has been highlighted in our study including the government initiatives to attract the involvement of private industry participants. Understanding the various factors affecting return on investment (ROI) in vocational education and training (VET) was the central focus of the study and provides governments not only with information on the performance of the system and justification for public expenditure, but also helps enterprises and individuals to measure productivity improvement in firms and at the same time determine increases in the employability of individuals following training investment.

However in this study, the measurement of ROI is not straightforward because the benefits and costs also include social cost of providing education, as well as

social benefits. This study used a conceptual framework for calculating the ROI to TVET and provides a guide to what type of information and data are required to determine the returns to TVET for government, employers and individuals.

To address the study's objectives, a mix-method design was used, incorporating both descriptive and inferential statistics. To assess the statistical differences in terms of perspective, an analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was employed to estimate the returns of individual investment in TVET, supported by a qualitative analysis.

In a nutshell, our findings contribute to the current discussion of the benefits of technical and vocational and training, either as an alternative education strategy aside from general higher education.

The needs for highly skilled manpower in Cambodia could be achieved through the active industry involvement in the design and development of Technical and Vocational Education (TVET) courses in the country. The industry participants in various consultation dialogues conducted by the Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training (MOLVT) through the Sector Skill Council have provided their intention to support the TVET sector, however, there are still a lot of things to be undertaken to ensure that collaborative partnership will be stronger than before.

Based on the results of the study, it appears that there is a need to strengthen the relationship between TVET agency and the industry in order to further solve the mismatch between the skills required by the industry and the courses being offered by TVET institutions. A more relevant critical decision point for policymakers and practitioners is to provide education that allows students to adapt to the changing environment of the world of work. This would demand a mixture of skill-specific subjects that equip students with the right skills needed by employers, as well as general skills that allow them to quickly adapt to changes in demand, should their existing skills become obsolete. The latter is even more relevant with the current speed of technological changes—which will affect the wages and employability of both fresh graduates and of the employed.

**Keywords:** *TVET, ROI, Analysis on Factors, Technical and vocational education, skilled workforce, industry engagement, public-private industry partnership.*

## Introduction

TVET issues have received much attention this past decade and TVET topics have been the focus at global forums organized by the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the Organization for Economic and Cultural Development (OECD), and the International Labor Organization (ILO).<sup>1</sup> Major world reports related to TVET have been released to document these discussions on the future direction of the vocational education sector. While TVET discussions in OECD countries have covered various topics ranging from shortages of skilled workers (Australia, Portugal, Spain), retention and completion rates at the secondary level (U.S., England, Denmark), to regional imbalances in development (Germany and Korea) (Grubb, 2006), in emerging and less- developed countries TVET discussions have focused on improving economic growth and competitiveness, and addressing issues around social exclusion and equity (Psacharopoulos, 1997).

In developing countries specifically, the recent rounds of debate around TVET are driven by concerns around the supply and demand of labor (World Bank, 2013). The imbalance in the supply and demand of labor has been attributed to massive demographic shifts (“youth bulges”) (World Bank, 2013), the changing nature of work and technological innovations (Grubb, 2006), low secondary education outcomes, especially among females (World Bank, 2012), poor flow of information between employers and job seekers, and a mismatch between skills, aspirations and labor market needs (Aggarwal et al., 2011; World Bank, 2012). While reforms in the TVET sector are not the only identified solutions to correct labor market imbalances (World Bank, 2013), they have been in the spotlight in several developing countries (World Bank, 2012; 2013) and guide the focus of this study.

The Sustainable Development Agenda for 2030 of the United Nations calls for all member states to “guarantee comprehensive and impartial education and promote lifetime knowledge prospects for all” and sets several of targets related to TVET, and “considerably improve the number of youth and adults who have pertinent skills, including technical and vocational skills, for occupation, decent works and business”. Despite the fact that TVET is an integral part of the education sector, there are still challenges in terms of contributing towards reasonable, comprehensive, supportable societies, and economies of the world (UNEVOC, 2016).

Technical and Vocational Education plays important roles in improving the economy of any country (Seng, 2007). Knowledgeable and trained manpower improves the economic development and prosperity of every country. Manda, Mwambu & Kamenyi, (2002) and Nyerere (2009) all agreed that TVET deliver core skills in entrepreneurship, communications, financial system, and leadership skills, as well as employment opportunities, whether in improving wages or running own business.

Typically, in the course of obtaining education, expenditures are incurred. These expenditures are incurred directly or indirectly at personal and organizational level. To compare the costs of TVET, the present study focused on the direct costs incurred by individual in acquiring TVET experience in the manufacturing industries. Comparing the costs of investing in TVET in various levels is necessary in order to assess the viability of investing in TVET. The Cambodia Qualification Framework (ADB, 2012) mentions the levels of TVET, which are: vocational certificate, certificate level 2 to 4, and higher diploma and bachelor of technology, and this study has paid attention on this specifically on artisans, crafts people, technician and technologists” cadres respectively.

Most countries with developed TVET system finance TVET heavily. For example, Singapore pays two or three times more than the general education according to United Nations Environmental, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO, 1995). Other countries like Peru fund TVET at the same level with academic institutions and the returns are almost identical for the graduates of the two streams (academic and technical education) (Bellow, 2002).

Economists mostly agree that investment in education usually receives a positive rate of return. Tsang (1997) agrees that the paybacks of TVET to a trainee are both monetary benefits (such as increased income, enhanced chances of getting a job or work placement and more steady work opportunities) and non-monetary benefits (such as increased occupational gratification and more work alternatives). Moreover, educational opportunities and benefits can be either to an individual or to society. Improvements to society include augmented financial productivity and better income opportunities. Nevertheless, the study is dedicated in determining the paybacks to an individual in terms of additional income.

The rate of return to education is a powerful financial mechanism or yardstick. It is used in educational policymaking as it determines the degree of yield from the investment in education (Shahar, 2008). On the other hand, Woodhall (2004) labels rate of return as a methodical comparison of the degree of the costs and benefits in any form of activities to improve one’s welfare. In fact, it is one of the methods used in Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) to determine the viability of an investment. It has been established that education is an investment in human resources.

---

<sup>1</sup> The *World Development Report on Jobs* (2013); *EFA Global Monitoring Report* (2012) on ‘Youth and Skills’; *OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training – Learning for Jobs* (2010); *Technical and Vocational Education and Training for the Twenty-First Century – UNESCO and ILO Recommendations* (2001).

Analysis on the rate of return to education has been used as a basis in assessing the economic improvement in the education sector worldwide (World Bank, 1996; Woodhall, 2004) but with limited consideration undertaken to the TVET sector. Psacharopoulos & Patrinos (2002) observed that most studies tend to focus on the rate of return to general academic education (primary, secondary and university), with very little attention being paid to the financial rate of return to TVET. Equally, Wolf (2009) underscores that both scientists and practitioners have so far neglected the economics of TVET while Nishimura & Orodho, (1999) recommended the need for rigorous studies on the economic returns to vocational education to guide on policies in Southeast Asia. Such study has not yet been undertaken with much detail in Cambodia. Therefore, this study has given focus to the monetary returns to technical skilled workers who are TVET graduates.

### Methodology

This study investigated the information in the field of collaboration in TVET based on review of related literature and key informant interviews with industry leaders and government officials that are working in the TVET sector. The study used mix-method of quantitative and qualitative study approaches. In terms of quantitative aspect, a statistical analysis was performed to estimate the returns of individual investment in TVET, which was also supported by qualitative analysis.

The independent variables that were used in this study included: the costs of TVET and the levels of TVET namely: vocational certificate, certificate level, diploma and higher diploma. In addition, the type of employment (whether one is salaried or self-employed) and personal characteristics was also used. The dependent variable includes the earnings (returns) to the technical skilled worker. The researcher collected data with the use of survey questionnaires, using cross-sectional data, that includes age–earning profiles.

Quantitative data were generated from the questionnaire and were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) and T-test tools were used to test the hypotheses, with 95 percent confidence level and 5 percent degree of error.

### Discussions and Key Findings

The study was conducted from July 2018 to December 2018 with a structured questionnaire for surveys, and questionnaire guides for key informant interviews, and focus group discussions. There were 222 private enterprise representatives who were selected and interviewed in the five selected target areas. Furthermore, the questionnaires for technical workers were distributed to a sample of 500 respondents taken conveniently among private enterprises at various locations. Overall, for the survey of technical workers there were 450 questionnaires collected, but only 426 were answered completely and accurately registering an effective sample rate of 94.66%.

In this study, only companies that have more than 100 workers and employees were included in the study. The total sample is dominated by garment and footwear factories (61 percent). Most of these large enterprises are foreign owned and relying on international markets for the products and services, and are located in the following provinces and key cities of the country: Battambang, Kampot, Phnom Penh, Siem Reap, Svay Rieng, and Takeo.

Using the quantitative and qualitative approaches, the following were the findings:

- The results show that there are **limited constructive linkages** between **TVET and industry** that are **truly meaningful and helpful to both employers and TVET suppliers, who benefit from the closer cooperation**. TVET students were considered by industry players to be generally and relatively well prepared for the workplace. However, there are also employers who considered that some lack the required skills, competencies and maturity to truly integrate into the workplace. Among the TVET providers, there is a varying level of quality of students and curriculum, thereby requiring employers to re-train them in the work place.
- **Industry faces medium to high turnover rates** resulting in loss of competitiveness of the industry and causing some delays in developing new products and services, delivery of orders etc. Most of the challenges related to turnover are a result of competition among the employers, less favorable perceptions towards industry and wanting to pursue higher waged work. *There is clearly a need for employers to embark on better management of staff including reviewing compensation and recognition and rewards programs within companies, to better retain employees.*
- *There is a mismatch between what TVET providers are training and what industry requires.* Despite the existence of TVET curriculum, *there are limited students graduating with the right skills for the industry.* TVET institution representatives also remarked that TVET number of graduates is declining in various skill areas, since they are more interested in getting a job, rather than being trained on TVET the proper way. Thus, there is a need for additional support to ensure a tighter cooperation between the industry and TVET institutions, so that the young Cambodians can gain the required training and certification needed to become qualified for their work in the industry.
- *Employers prefer the establishment of Public-Private-Partnerships to address training needs, rather than support a training levy.* All large employers have in-house training of varying sorts which are provided to all employees. Internal training is the most used mode of training than

linking with external training providers.

- **TVET providers need to establish closer links with industry in their region.** Data in the survey provided indications of the types of sectors to collaborate with and where there are plenty of employment opportunities. In addition, marketing TVET training and linking it to jobs with the industry, could be a powerful mechanism to increase the number of students in TVET. Other types of learning programs like paid apprenticeships system can also be established. It might be useful to have industry and TVET skills councils in different regions to improve the number and quality of TVET providers and the quality of graduating students.
- **The ANOVA analysis reveals that there is no significant statistical differences between wages of TVET and GHE graduates, but the statistical results also implied that GHE graduates command little wage premium.** Furthermore, there is no significant differences between individual direct cost of enrolling in TVET with the level of CQF at F-statistic = 5.42 and P-value = 0.000. Also, the result of study revealed that CQF level of TVET has significant positive relationship with income earning as respondents with higher level of TVET make more income compared to those with lower levels of TVET at F-statistics posted at 14.84 with a p-value of 0.00, which was less than 0.05.
- **Summary statistics show that TVET graduates earn on the average US\$256 per month—US\$175.33 for Certificate Level 2 (C1), US\$312 for Certificate Level 3 (C2), USD 363 Certificate Level 4 (C3), USD US\$373 for Higher Diploma, and US\$391 for a bachelor's degree.** It was learned from the study that those graduates from general higher education earn on the average **US\$395 per month**. This result means that there is an increase in lifetime earnings with every level of TVET. The result shows that average monthly income is slightly increasing with the level of technical education while certificate L1 to Higher diploma and bachelor's degree had 25% difference at each level.

A qualitative analysis provided the following findings:

- **The relationship of TVET graduates' skill and the labor market:** The TVET graduates' skills are perceived to be in high demand over the next five years. They have more opportunities in the labor market than the university graduates. As per the interview results, they have a better chance of securing the jobs that are most suited to their skills. The private sector has played a key role in facilitating the transitioning of TVET graduates into the labor market, through internship opportunities and additional skills advancement activities in the workplace. However, their entry into the job

market was considered relatively easier, but their career advancement is somewhat challenging due to their lack of necessary skills required for the job.

- **TVET social marketing is an effective way to promote youth employability:** Under the support from ADB TVETSDP, MLVT is starting to use social marketing to improve TVET graduates' employability, based on interviews with senior management of DGTNET. However, there is ongoing debate over the effectiveness of these initiatives, however, due to the slow implementation and progress of the reported initiatives, especially at the provincial level. The practical industrial experiences of the trainers and their classroom facilitating skills have slightly improved. Overall results have shown that the capacity TVET trainers have improved over the years. However, in terms of the regularity, length, cycle and the kind of the training provided are far beyond the TVET trainers' expectations. Having more TVET institutions located near each and other offering the same/similar courses may not be efficient given the costly operation of the TVET system and limited number of enrolled students. TVET institutions, especially at the provincial level, continue to face human resource challenges regarding qualifications and numbers.

## Conclusions

Despite the findings, it is very important for policymakers and practitioners to implement a strategy to provide education that allows students to adopt and adapt to the changing environment of the working world. This would demand a mixture of skill-specific subjects that equip students with the right skills needed by the employers, as well as general overarching skills that allow students to acquire new skills once the existing ones become obsolete. The latter is even more relevant due to the current speed of technological changes, which affect the wages and employability of fresh graduates, as well as of the employed.

## Recommendations

Given the above findings and explanations, the following for policy consideration are recommended:

- **TVET institutions should organize orientation programs regularly** to raise awareness of parents and students about the many benefits in choosing TVET for their professional career. The importance of TVET in accelerating economic growth should be emphasized to encourage and promote among parents and students.
- **Taking advantage of the general public's increasing access to the internet** and in particular social media websites, the media campaign should include advertisements and articles in local and

social media websites about the importance of TVET careers in improving national economy.

- **Adopting face to face communications** by organizing workshops in secondary schools, so that TVET representatives can talk directly to the students and their parents. Face to face communication is a highly effective marketing tool and allows the opportunity for the audience to have their questions answered on the spot.
- **Organize events which help bridge the gap between employers and TVET graduates**, especially during TVET Day in various strategic locations and TVET Institutions across the country. These events will help bring together in one place the TVET graduates and their prospective employers.
- **Build partnerships and coordinate with National Employment Agency (NEA) to promote the value and job opportunities of TVET skills.** The Job Advisory Center offers advisory services which enhance the soft skills and technical skills of recent graduates and match them with potential employers. There is a need to ensure that the curriculum of all TVET programs are up-to-date and of high quality.
- **The entire curriculum should be oriented to the outcomes which closely relate to the working standards and education** by ensuring that all graduates have the skills they need to compete in rapid changing societies. The development of the new curriculum based on the skills training system may be a good step to supply and demand.
- **The curriculum should be innovative by incorporating information and technology**, developing new partnerships (with industry and community) and ensuring that this system is acceptable and accountable to labor market needed for large industries.
- **Implement a national strategy to improve the status and awareness of technical skills related jobs and the career pathways** for the technical skill level courses. The promotion of technical skills as a valued career choice should target both males and females and be done in partnership with priority industries, particularly construction, manufacturing, hospitality and the garment sectors.
- **Industries should also support such campaigns to ensure the success of such national initiative.** This strategy provides an opportunity to undertake a small symbiotic partnership with industry, as a small first step in developing the relationships and trust required for larger more ambitious partnerships.
- **The MoLVT and MoEYS should work together and allocate a small amount of funds to partner**

**with industry**, and work together in this small but meaningful partnership opportunity and campaign. So, both Ministries should review the strategy and policy to improve the whole TVET sector and all policies and strategy should be developed by inter-ministry decision making which will help match supply with industries' needs.

- **Quality rather than quantity.** The focus could be on electricity/electronics, construction, manufacturing, auto-mechanic and information technology. Given the expensive TVET operational costs within the context of resource scarcity, specializing in some selected major skills based on their market niche may help reduce the resource allocation problem. Moreover, specialization also facilitates effective resource channeling. Maybe during this early stage of the new TVET branding, each TVET should distinctively specialize in some skills rather than offering similar skills, especially if TVET institutions are located in close proximity to each other. Therefore, starting with the 38 TVET institutions under the Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training, all the TVET institutions with close stakeholder consultations, should identify and agree on their potential specific focus for skills development.
- **Strengthening English language of the TVET graduates.** The employers and the TVET graduates have stated that English language is very important for them to communicate and study further, so the TVET institutions should continue to strengthen English language competency of TVET graduates.

### **Recommendations for Further Research and Way Forward**

In a nutshell, our findings contribute to the current discussion of the benefits of technical and vocational education and training, either as an alternative or as a complementing education strategy in addition to general higher education. The findings of having lack of significant wage differences between TVET and GHE graduates, and a higher chance of landing a job after TVET graduation is encouraging, and somewhat countervailing, due to the perception that TVET is second-tier or second-rank education. Despite this, the challenge ahead for the government and the private sector is to encourage more students into the TVET sector—a tough battle that is worth the fight.

Finally, a more relevant thinking point for policymakers and practitioners is to provide education that allows students to adapt to the changing environment of the working world. This would demand a mixture of skill-specific subjects that equip students with the right skills needed by employers, as well as general skills that allow them to quickly adapt to changes in demand, should their existing skills become obsolete. The latter is even more relevant with the current speed of technological changes—which will affect the wages and employability of both fresh graduates and of the employed.

The study makes the following recommendations for further research based on the limitations and delimitations of the study:

Since the current study determined individual direct cost of TVET to technical workers, it is recommended that a similar study can be done in other sectors of the economy that have been identified to push economic development. A similar study can be done by identifying the key determinants of RoI to TVET and in term of using the regression equation on the impact of years of schooling and work experiences on livelihood of workers (income).

Since there was a short supply for short course and no supply CQF Level 2 and 4 for the self-employment unlike the diploma and bachelor's degree respondents, a study can be carried out to find out why these low cadres do not start their own business. Besides, a study on factors discouraging skilled technical women to start their own self-employment can also be carried out, this is because the proportion of women to men found as technical skilled workers was minimal.

## References

Afzal, M (2013). Future focus: 2013 National Workforce Development Strategy. *AWPA, Melbourne*.

Afzal, M, (2011). Microeconomic Analysis of Private Returns to Education and Determinants of Earnings. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*. Vol 49 (1), pp 39-68.

Australian Productivity Commission (2012). Impacts of COAG reforms: business regulation and VET: Productivity Commission research report, Productivity Commission, Melbourne, viewed April 2016. <<http://www.pc.gov.au/projects/study/coag-reporting/report>>.

Australian Workforce and Productivity Agency (AWPA) (2013). Human capital and productivity: literature review. *AWPA, Canberra*.

Bailey, A, (2007). Canadian Council on Learning Work and Learning Knowledge Centre, Connecting the dots ... linking training investment to business outcomes and the economy. *Canadian Council on Learning, Ottawa*.

Bartel, A, (2000). Measuring the Employer's Return on Investments in Training: Evidence from the Literature. *Industrial Relations*. Vol 39 (3), July, pp 502 – 524. Blackwell Publishers.

Beddie, F, O'Connor, L & Curtin, P (eds) (2013). Structures in tertiary education and training: a kaleidoscope or merely fragments? *research readings*. *NCVER, Adelaide*.

Bernier, A & Cousnieau, JM (2010). The impact of training on productivity in Canadian firms: estimating distributed lags from the WES 1995-2005. *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences*, vol.5, no.7.

Blandy, R, Dockery, M, Hawke, A & Webster, E (2000). Does training pay? Evidence from Australian enterprises. *NCVER, Adelaide*.

BMBF (2014). Report on Vocational Training 2015. Retrieved November 18, 2018. From BMBF: [http://www.bmbf.de/pub/Report\\_on\\_vocational\\_education\\_and\\_training\\_2014\\_bf.pdf](http://www.bmbf.de/pub/Report_on_vocational_education_and_training_2014_bf.pdf).

Brown, J, Taylor, M, McKenzie, P & Perkins, K (2015). Investing in workforce literacy Pays: building employer commitment to workplace language, Literacy and Numeracy Programs. *Melbourne, ACER*.

Buddelmeyer, H, Leung, F & Scutella, R (2012). Educating oneself out of social exclusion. *NCVER, Adelaide*.

CAMFEBA. (2008). A Study about Youth and Employer Perspective on Education Skills Opportunities and the Future.

Canton, E (2007). Social returns to education: macro evidence. *Industrial Policy and Economic Reform Papers no.9*. De Economist. vol.155, no.4, pp.449—68.

Cedefop (2011b). The anatomy of the wider benefits of VET in the workplace. *Cedefop research paper no. 12*. Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, viewed April 2016, <<http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/download-manager.aspx?id=17946&lang=en&type=publication>>.

Cedefop (2011c). Vocational education and training is good for you: the social benefits of VET for individuals. *Cedefop research paper no. 17*. Publications Office of the European Union. Luxembourg, viewed April 2016. <<http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/publications/18440.aspx>>.

Cedefop (2011d). The economic benefits of VET for individuals, *Cedefop research paper no. 11*. Publications Office of the European Union. Luxembourg, viewed November 2016. <<http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/publications/5511>>.

Cedefop (2013). Benefits of vocational education and training in Europe for people, organisations and countries. *Publications Office of the European Union*. Luxembourg, viewed April 2016. <<http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/download-manager.aspx?id=21467&lang=en&type=publication>>.



- Cedefop (European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training) (2011a). Vocational education and training for the common good: the macrosocial benefits of VET. *Cedefop research paper no. 13*. Publications Office of the European Union, Luxembourg, viewed April 2016. <<http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/download-manager.aspx?id=18284&lang=en&type=publication>>.
- Chapman, B, Rodrigues, M & Ryan, C (2007) HECS for TAFE: the case for extending income contingent loans to the vocational education and training sector. *Treasury working paper 2007-2. Treasury, Canberra, viewed August 2015*. <<http://www.treasury.gov.au/documents/1252/PDF/TWP07-02.pdf>>.
- Chesters, J, Ryan, C & Sinning, M (2013). The returns to literacy skills in Australia. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Christine Uher Gonçalves (December 2019). Financing TVET: A Comparative Analysis in Six Asian Countries.
- Christopher Winch. (2013). UNESCO-UNEVOC- Revisiting global trends in TVET. Chapter 3: Attractiveness of TVET. Retrieved March 2016, from [http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/fileadmin/up/2013\\_epub\\_revisiting\\_global\\_trends\\_in\\_tvset\\_chapter3.pdf](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/fileadmin/up/2013_epub_revisiting_global_trends_in_tvset_chapter3.pdf).
- Columbo, L & Stanca, E (2008). The impact of training on productivity: evidence from a large panel of firms. *Working Papers 134. University of Milano-Bicocca, Department of Economics*.
- D'Amico, S. (2009). Cambodia's human resource development: Building a skilled workforce. *Paper presented at Cambodia Outlook Conference, 12 March 2009, Phnom Penh*.
- D'Amico, S. (2012). Knowledge and skills needed by the Cambodian economy. *Presentation at policy roundtable on Higher Education and Vocational Training in Cambodia*. 30 August 2012, Phnom Penh.
- Dearden, L, Reed, H & Van Reenan, J (2005) Who gains when workers train? *Institute of Fiscal studies, WP 00/04, UK*.
- Deloitte Access Economics & National VET Equity Advisory Council (NVEAC) (2011). The economic and social benefit of increased participation by disadvantaged students in VET. *NVEAC, Melbourne*.
- Doucouliafos, C & Sgro, P (2000). Enterprise return on a training investment. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- European Training Foundation (ETF) (2008). Impact assessment studies and their implications for policy making. *Edited by Castejon, JM and Chakroun, B, Torino*.
- Green, F & McIntosh, S (2006). Non-certified learning and skills: incidence in the UK, variation across countries and links to productivity. *Department of Trade and Industry*.
- Griffin, T (2016). Costs and benefits of education and training for the economy, business and individuals. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Helper, S, Noonan, R, Nicholson, J & Langdon, D (2016). The benefits and costs of apprenticeships: an employer perspective. *Economics and Statistics Administration, Washington*.
- Hoeckel, K, (2008). Costs and benefits in vocational education and training. *OECD, Paris. viewed April 2016*. <<http://www.oecd.org/education/country-studies/41538706.pdf>>.
- Homs, O (2007). Euromed observatory function indicators for the governance of vocational training systems. *European Training Foundation, Torino, Italy*.
- Independent Economics (2013) Cost-benefit analysis and returns from additional investment in vocational education and training. *Independent Economics, Kingston. viewed April 2016* <[http://www.tda.edu.au/cb\\_pages/files/Econometric%20Final%20Report.pdf](http://www.tda.edu.au/cb_pages/files/Econometric%20Final%20Report.pdf)>.
- Investing in Partnerships (IIP) (2012). Social return on investment: lesson learned in Australia. *Prepared for Investing in Impact Partnership*.
- Karmel, T & Fieger, P (2012). The value of completing a VET qualification. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Karmel, T & Nguyen, N (2006). The value of completing a vocational education and training qualification. *NCVER*.
- Kennett, G (2013). The impact of training practices on individual, organisation and industry skill development. *Australian Bulletin of Labour*. vol.39, no.1, pp.112—35.
- Khieng Sothy, Srinivasa Madhur, & Chime Rethy, eds. (2015). *Cambodia Education 2015: Employment and Empowerment*. Phnom Penh: CDRI.
- Knight, J. and Rapley, J. (2007). Educational Reform in Jamaica: Recommendations from Ireland, Finland and Singapore. Jamaica: Caribbean Policy Research Institute. <http://www.psoj.org/files/Education%20Reform%20Report.pdf>
- Lee, WS & Coelli, M (2010). Analysis of private returns to VET. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Leigh, A (2008). Returns to education in Australia. *Economic Papers: A Journal of Applied Economics and Policy*/. vol. 27, no.3, pp.233—49.

- Long, M & Shah, C (2008) Private returns to vocational education and training qualifications. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Madhur, S. (2014). Cambodia's Skill Gap: An anatomy of issues and policy options. CDRI Working Paper Series No. 98. Phnom Penh: CDRI.
- Maglen, L, Hopkins, S & Burke, G (2001). Training for productivity. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Marope, P, Chakroun, B & Holmes, K (2015). Unleashing the potential: transforming technical and vocational Education and Training. *Paris, UNESCO*.
- Mawer, G & Jackson, E (2005). Training of existing workers: issues, incentives and models. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- McMahon, WC (2004). The social and external benefits of education. *International handbook of the economics of education*. eds G Johnes & J Johnes. Edward Elgar Publishing, Cheltenham.
- MLVT (2020). Directorate General of TVET (DGTVET) Budget Plan. DGTVET.
- MLVT (May 2017 ed.). TVET Statistics. *DGTVET of MLVT, Phnom Penh*.
- National VET Equity Advisory Council (NVEAC) (2011). Equity blueprint 2011—2016: creating futures: Achieving Potential through VET. *NVEAC, Melbourne, viewed June 2017*. <<http://www.acpet.edu.au/uploads/files/NMU2012/May/NVEAC%20Equity%20Blueprint%202011%20to%202016%20Creating%20Futures%20%20Achieving%20Potential%20through%20VET.pdf>>.
- NCVER (2015a). Australian vocational education and training statistics: employers' use and views of the VET system 2015. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- NCVER (2015b). Australian vocational education and training statistics: government-funded student outcomes 2015. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Noonan, P, Brown, J, Long, M, McKenzie, P & Chapman, B (2010). Investment in vocational education and training (VET): a report to the Board of Skills Australia: overview analysis and options for improvement. *Skills Australia, Canberra, viewed April 2016*. <<https://docs.education.gov.au/system/files/doc/other/investment-in-vet-2010.pdf>>.
- Paes de Carvalho, C. (2012). Vocational education and learning in higher education. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*. 10 (1), pp.77-94.
- Priest, S (2009). What is "social capital" and how can vocational education and training help develop it?". *NCVER, Adelaide. Paper presented at the Australian Learning Communities Network. Viewed April 2016*, <<http://www.ncver.edu.au/publications/2113.html>>.
- Richardson, S (2004). Employers' contribution to training. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Schueler, J (2016). Evaluation framework measuring Return on Investment (ROI) in TVET. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Seng, L. (2011). Vocational and technical education and training VTEC in South Asia.
- Smith, A, Oczkowski, E & Hill, M (2009). Reasons for training: why Australian employers train their workers. *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Stanwick, J, Ong, K & Karmel, T (2006). Vocational education and training, health and wellbeing: is there a relationship? *NCVER, Adelaide*.
- Stufflebeam, D, Madaus, G, & Kellaghan, T (2000) Evaluation models (revised edition). *Kluwer Academic Publishing, Boston*.
- United Nations (2015). Transforming our world: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. *Paris, United Nations*.
- Watson, T (2011). Return on investment in public relations: a critical assessment of concepts used by practitioners from the perspectives of communication and management sciences. *EUPRERA- Annual Congress of the European Public Relations Education and Research Association, At Leeds, UK*.
- Woodhall, M. (2004). Cost-benefit analysis in educational planning (4th Ed). *Paris: UNESCO – IIEP*.
- Zwick, T (2006). The impact of training intensity on establishment productivity. *Industrial relations: a journal of economy and society*. vol.45, no.1, pp.26—46.

## About the Author



*\*Dr Sok Chanrithy recently graduated with a degree in Doctor of Business Administration from Pannasastra University of Cambodia. He is a highly experienced TVET expert with more than 10 years working in the field. In Cambodia he is a leading expert in result measurement in TVET having been a monitoring and evaluation advisor for many TVET projects in the country. Among his key qualifications include: technical and vocational education and training (systems, programs and projects), labor market policies, labor-based road works, including all aspects and phases of project cycle management (as researcher and developer, author and promoter); program and project strategy development, project design, backstopping and staff training, facilitation of planning workshops, appraisals and evaluations; development of planning, evaluation and monitoring tools (as senior consultant, backstopper, trainer); research on and design of National Qualifications Frameworks (as trainer, author, advisor). Aside from his DBA, he completed the following degrees: International MBA, National Cheng Kung University, 2007 in Taiwan; Bachelor of Hotel and Tourism, National University of Management, 2004; and Bachelor of Science in Economics, Royal University of Laws and Economics, 2003.*

*His recent consultancy engagements are in the following projects: National Organizational Development Review Specialist, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, ADB, May 2020 to present; National TVET HRM Specialist, Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training, ADB, May 2019 to present; Deputy Team Leader/TVET and Education Specialist, MLVT, ADB, Sept. 2018 to May 2019; National VSC, SBP, and VSTP M & E Specialist, Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training, ADB, April 2018 to present; National M & E Specialist, MLVT/ADB, April 2016 to December 2017; and Team Leader/Project Evaluator, Caritas Cambodia – Vocational Skills Development for the Youth, 2013-2015, Sept to December 2016. He may be reached at [chanrithy@gmail.com](mailto:chanrithy@gmail.com)*

# St Clements Education Group – E-Journal *Veritas*

## NOTES TO CONTRIBUTORS

Editor: Mr Adrian Williams

Contributions should be forwarded to Mr Adrian Williams at [admin@stclements.edu](mailto:admin@stclements.edu)

Contributors may contact the editors for advice on publication if they wish – email above. Otherwise the following guidelines are offered:

### CONTRIBUTIONS

The Journal takes the following:

- Short articles and essays 1500 - 2500 words\*
- Research Reports
- Notes
- Letters to the Editor re published articles
- Book Reviews

**\*IMPORTANT:** Articles greater than the stipulated size limit will be published in the St Clements E-Library and a summary of the article will be required to be provided to the editor for inclusion in the '*Veritas*' E-Journal. A link to the full article for those wishing to read more than the summary will be available within the E-Journal publication.

### AUTHOR'S DETAILS

New authors are asked to submit the following with their paper:

- Details of their academic qualifications
- Their current place of work – title, address
- A head and shoulders photograph of themselves
- Their email address

### SUBMISSION

All articles must be submitted by email

### FORMAT

Contributors are asked to observe the following format where possible:

**Title:** 14pt Times Roman Font

**Name:** Author's name and brief biography together with a head and shoulders photo

**Body:** 10pt Times Roman Font for text

9pt Times Roman Font for tables

**References in text:** In the text ALL quotations must have quotation marks and a reference, e.g.

*James said 'all dogs are brown' (James, 2002)*

**Reference List:** List in **author's surnames alphabetically**

We observe the Harvard format, i.e.

- For a book: P.Jones (2001): Water Management, Raven Press, London.
- Journal reference: W.Smith (1998): 'Lemon Growing', *The Journal of Agriculture*, V.45-2, p.10.
- Reference to work listed directly preceding: *ibid*, p.20
- Newspapers: *The Star*, 3 September 1986
- Report: Australian Bushfire Commission Annual Report, 1997, p.71
- Unpublished thesis: M.Broad, "The Utility of Cross Referencing", M.Ed. Thesis, St Clements University 1999

**Note:** Any contributions received that do not meet the required criteria, as stated above, will be returned to the author until the correct format is achieved and only then will it be considered for publication.